



85 7TH PLACE EAST, SUITE 500
SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA 55101-2198
MIN.GOV/COMMERCE
651.539.1500 FAX: 651.539.1547
AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER

January 28, 2015

Mr. Daniel P. Wolf
Executive Secretary
Minnesota Public Utilities Commission
121 Seventh Place East, Suite 350
St. Paul, Minnesota 55101

RE: Report to the Minnesota Legislature
Docket No. E999/M-14-237

Dear Mr. Wolf,

Attached please find the Department of Commerce, Division of Energy Resources Report to the Minnesota Legislature on Progress on Compliance by Electric utilities with the Minnesota Renewable Energy Objective and the Renewable Energy Standard. The Report is submitted pursuant to Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 3(b).

The Department is available to answer any questions the Commission may have.

Sincerely,

/s/ SUSAN L. PEIRCE
Rate Analyst

SLP/ja
Attachment

MINNESOTA RENEWABLE ENERGY STANDARD: UTILITY COMPLIANCE

SUBMITTED BY



DIVISION OF ENERGY RESOURCES

JANUARY 15, 2015

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Section	Page
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
A. Legislative History	1
1. Adoption of a Renewable Energy Objective (REO).....	1
2. Adoption of a Renewable Energy Standard (RES).....	2
a. The Renewable Energy Standard	2
b. Changes to the Definition of an Eligible Energy Technology.....	3
c. The Use of Renewable Energy Certificates to Meet RES Requirements.....	4
d. Criteria for Waiving or Extending the RES Requirements	4
e. Solar Energy Standard (SES)	5
f. Reporting on the Rate Impact of RES Compliance.....	5
B. RES Reporting Requirements.....	5
1. Entities Subject to the RES Requirements	5
2. Determination of Generation Eligible for the Minnesota RES	6
C. 2013 RES Compliance.....	7
D. Ability to Comply with RES Requirements in the Future	8
E. Obstacles and Potential Solutions for Meeting the RES Requirements.....	9
II. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION.....	10

**REPORT TO THE MINNESOTA LEGISLATURE:
PROGRESS ON COMPLIANCE BY ELECTRIC UTILITIES WITH
THE MINNESOTA RENEWABLE ENERGY OBJECTIVE AND THE RENEWABLE ENERGY STANDARD**

The Minnesota Department of Commerce, Division of Energy Resources (Commerce or the Department) offers the following report on the progress of Minnesota's electric utilities' compliance with the Minnesota Renewable Energy Objective (REO) and the Renewable Energy Standard (RES) contained in Minn. Stat. § 216B.1691.

I. INTRODUCTION

Commerce provides this report in compliance with Minn. Stat. § 216B.1691, subd. 3(b) which requires a biannual report to the Legislature on "the progress of utilities in the state, including the progress of each individual electric utility, in increasing the amount of renewable energy provided to retail customers," along with the compilation of the following information from each utility:

- The status of the utility's renewable energy mix relative to the objective and standards;
- Efforts taken to meet the objective and standards;
- Any obstacles encountered or anticipated in meeting the objective or standards; and
- Potential solutions to the obstacles.

This RES Report is divided into the following sections:

- Legislative History
- RES Reporting Requirements
- 2013 RES Compliance
- Ability to Comply with RES Requirements in the Future
- Obstacles and Potential Solutions for Meeting Future RES Requirements
- Summary and Conclusions

A. LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

1. Adoption of a Renewable Energy Objective

The Minnesota Renewable Energy Objective (REO) contained in Minnesota Stat. §216B.1691 (REO Statute) was first enacted by the Minnesota Legislature in 2001. As originally enacted the Statute required electric utilities to "make a good faith effort" to obtain ten percent of their Minnesota retail energy sales from eligible energy sources by 2015, and to obtain 0.5 percent of their renewable energy from biomass technologies. Under the REO Statute, Northern States Power, doing business as Xcel Energy was required to meet a ten percent renewable energy standard.

In 2003, the Legislature amended the REO Statute to require the Minnesota Public Utilities Commission (Commission) to supervise and facilitate utilities' good faith efforts to meet their REO obligations. Specifically, the REO Statute was amended to require the Commission to issue an initial Order and subsequent Orders as necessary to:

- Detail criteria and standards for measuring a utility's efforts to meet the REO, and for determining whether a utility has met the good faith requirement;

- Detail criteria and standards that protect against undesirable impacts on the reliability of the utility's system, undesirable economic impacts to a utility's ratepayers, and that consider technical feasibility;
- Provide a weighted scale that determines how energy generated by different technologies counts toward a utility's objective and that grants multiple credits for technologies and fuels the Commission finds in the public interest to encourage; and
- Consider the establishment of a program for tradeable renewable energy credits.

The Commission subsequently solicited comments from interested parties, and issued a series of Orders setting forth the criteria for measuring an electric utility's good faith efforts in meeting the REO Statute.¹

2. *Adoption of a Renewable Energy Standard*

During the 2007 Legislative Session, Minn. Stat. §216B.1691 was amended to:

- 1) Establish a Renewable Energy Standard (RES) with specified mandated renewable energy goals beginning in 2010;
- 2) Amend the definition of an eligible energy technology;
- 3) Require the Commission to establish a trading system for renewable credits; and
- 4) Establish criteria under which the Commission may waive or extend the deadline for meeting the RES targets.

a. *The Renewable Energy Standard*

Consistent with the earlier REO, the RES Statute requires that a utility generate or procure at least one percent of its retail electric sales from an eligible energy technology beginning in 2005 increasing to seven percent by 2010. However, unlike the REO, the RES mandates that electric utilities procure this level of energy. Beginning in 2010 for Xcel, and 2012 for all other utilities, the RES Statute added Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 2(a) and (b) to require:

- (a) Except as provided in paragraph (b), each electric utility shall generate or procure sufficient electricity generated by an eligible energy technology to provide its retail customers in Minnesota, or the retail customers of a distribution utility to which the electric utility

¹ *In the Matter of Detailing Criteria and Standards for Measuring an Electric Utility's Good Faith Efforts in Meeting the Renewable Energy Objectives Under Minn. Stat. §216B.1691*, Docket No. E999/CI-03-869, Initial Order Detailing Criteria and Standards for Determining Compliance with Minn. Stat. §216B.1691 and Requiring Customer Notification by Certain Cooperative, Municipal, and Investor-Owned Distribution Utilities. (June 1, 2004).

In the Matter of Detailing Criteria and Standards for Measuring an Electric Utility's Good Faith Efforts in Meeting the Renewable Energy Objectives Under Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, Docket No. E999/CI-03-869; *In the Matter of a Commission Investigation into a Multi-State Tracking and Trading System for Renewable Energy Credits*, Docket No. E999/CI-04-1616, Second Order Implementing Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, Opening Docket to Investigate Multi-State Program for Tracking and Trading Renewable Credits and Requesting Periodic Updates from Stakeholder Group; (October 19, 2004).

In the Matter of Detailing Criteria and Standards for Measuring an Electric Utility's Good Faith Efforts in Meeting the Renewable Energy Objectives Under Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, Docket No. E999/CI-03-869, Order After Reconsideration (August 13, 2004).

provides wholesale service, so that at least the following standard percentages of the electric utility's total retail electric sales to retail customers in Minnesota is generated by eligible energy technologies by the end of the year indicated:

- 1) 2012 12 percent
- 2) 2016 17 percent
- 3) 2020 20 percent
- 4) 2025 25 percent

(b) An electric utility that owned a nuclear generating facility as of January 1, 2007, must meet the requirements of this paragraph rather than paragraph (a). An electric utility subject to this paragraph must generate or procure sufficient electricity generated by an eligible energy technology to provide its retail customers in Minnesota or the retail customers of a distribution utility to which the electric utility provides wholesale electric service so that at least the following percentages of the electric utility's total retail electric sales to retail customers in Minnesota is generated by eligible energy technologies by the end of the year indicated:

- 1) 2010 15 percent
- 2) 2012 18 percent
- 3) 2016 25 percent
- 4) 2020 30 percent

Of the 30 percent in 2020, at least 25 percent must be generated by wind energy conversion systems and the remaining five percent by other eligible energy technologies.

In its March 19, 2010 Order, the Commission clarified that the percentages of total retail sales that utilities must generate or procure from renewable energy apply for every year forward until the next step in percentages identified by the statute. Consequently, for 2013 Xcel's RES requirement remained at 18 percent, and all other utilities remained at 12 percent.

In 2010, the RES Statute definition of total retail electric sales was amended to exclude "the sale of hydroelectricity supplied by a federal power marketing administration or other federal agency, regardless of whether the sales are directly to a distribution utility or are made to a generation and transmission utility and pooled for further allocation to a distribution utility." The amendment results in the exclusion of power provided by the Western Area Power Administration from total retail sales.

b. Changes to the Definition of an Eligible Energy Technology

Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 1 defines an eligible energy technology as one that:

Generates electricity from the following renewable energy sources: (1) solar; (2) wind; (3) hydroelectric with a capacity of less than 100 megawatts; (4) hydrogen provided that after January 1, 2010, the hydrogen must be generated from the resources listed in this clause; or (5) biomass, which includes, without limitation, landfill gas; an anaerobic digester system; the predominantly organic components of wastewater effluent, sludge, or related by-products from publicly

owned treatment works, but not including incineration of wastewater sludge to produce electricity; and an energy recovery facility used to capture the heat value of mixed municipal solid waste or refuse-derived fuel from mixed municipal solid waste as a primary fuel.

The definition of an eligible energy technology cited above reflects a number of changes made by the Legislature since eligible technologies were originally defined under the REO Statute. Specifically, the capacity of hydroelectric facilities eligible for RES compliance was increased from 60 to 100 megawatts, and the definition of biomass was clarified to include landfill gas, and anaerobic digester systems. Finally, the restriction was lifted on Xcel's ability to count biomass and wind generation from its Prairie Island Legislative mandates.² The 2007 amendments to the RES Statute render generation from these mandates eligible to count toward RES compliance.

c. The Use of Renewable Energy Certificates to Meet RES Requirements

The 2003 amendment to Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 4, provided that the Commission “may establish a program for tradable credits for electricity generated by eligible energy technology.” The 2007 amendment to Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 4 required the Commission to establish a program for tradable Renewable Energy Credits (RECs) by January 1, 2008, and to require all electric utilities to participate in a Commission-approved REC tracking system once such a system was in operation.

In an October 2007 Order, the Commission approved the use of the Midwest Renewable Energy Tracking system (M-RETS) as the REC tracking system under Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 4(d), and required Minnesota utilities to participate. In its December 18, 2007 *Order Establishing Initial Protocols for Trading Renewable Energy Credits*, the Commission adopted a four-year shelf life for RECs.³ A four year shelf life means the REC is eligible for use meeting the RES requirements in the year of generation and for four years following the year of generation.

Finally, in its December 3, 2008 *Third Order Detailing Criteria and Standards for Determining Compliance under Minn. Stat. §216B.1691 and Setting Procedures for Retiring Renewable Energy Credits*, the Commission directed utilities to begin retiring RECs equivalent to one percent of their Minnesota annual retail sales for the 2008 and 2009 compliance year by May 1st of the following year. Upon retirement, RECs are transferred into a specific Minnesota RES retirement account and, once retired, are not available to meet other state or program requirements, thus addressing the statutory prohibition against double counting the RECs and promoting the environmental benefits of renewable energy. The Commission further directed the utilities to submit an annual compliance filing demonstrating their compliance with the RES by June 1st.

d. Criteria for Waiving or Extending the RES Requirements

The RES Statute was amended to include criteria under which the Commission may find it in the public interest to modify or delay implementation of the RES requirements. Among the factors the Commission must consider are:

² As part of earlier Legislative authorization for additional storage for spent nuclear fuel at Xcel's Prairie Island nuclear facility, Xcel was required to obtain 825 MW of wind energy (Minn. Stat. §216B.2423) and 125 MW of biomass energy (Minn. Stat. §216B.2424).

³ *In the Matter of a Commission Investigation into a Multi-State Tracking and Trading System for Renewable Energy Credits*, Docket No. E999/CI-04-1616, *Order Establishing Initial Protocols for Trading Renewable Energy Credits* (December 18, 2007).

- 1) The impact on customer's utility costs, including the economic and competitive pressure on the utility's customers;
- 2) The effects on electric system reliability;
- 3) Technical advances and concerns;
- 4) Rejection or delays in obtaining site and route permits;
- 5) Delays, cancellations or nondelivery of necessary equipment for construction of a facility;
- 6) Transmission constraints; and
- 7) Other statutory obligations imposed on the Commission or utility. [Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 2b]

Upon a petition by a utility, the Commission may modify or delay an RES standard under numbers (1) to (3) "only if it finds implementation would cause significant rate impact, requires significant measures to address reliability, or raises significant technical issues." For the remaining items, Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 2b allows modification or delay in the implementation of a standard only if the Commission "finds that the circumstances described in those clauses were due to circumstances beyond an electric utility's control and make compliance not feasible." To date, no utility has requested a modification or delay in the implementation of the RES requirements.

e. Solar Energy Standard (SES)

In 2014, the Minnesota Legislature adopted Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 2f establishing a Solar Energy Standard (SES) requiring public utilities to obtain at least 1.5 percent of their total Minnesota retail sales from solar energy by the end of 2020, with at least 10 percent of the 1.5 percent from solar facilities with a nameplate capacity of 20 kilowatts or less. The statute establishes a goal of obtaining ten percent of Minnesota retail sales from solar energy by 2030.

Four of the sixteen companies subject to the RES are also subject to the SES: Interstate Power & Light, Minnesota Power, Ottertail Power Company, and Xcel Energy. In addition to excluding cooperative and municipal utilities from the SES requirements, the SES statute excludes retail sales to customers that are iron mining extraction and processing facilities, or paper mills, wood products manufacturers, sawmills, or oriented strand board manufacturers from the calculation of 1.5 percent of retail sales.

Utilities subject to the SES submitted an initial report on their progress towards meeting the solar requirement on July 1, 2014. At the time their initial SES reports were filed in June, the utilities subject to the SES requirement estimated a need to add approximately 368 MW in solar capacity to meet the 2020 SES requirement.

f. Reporting on the Rate Impact of RES Compliance

Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 2e, was amended to require the Commission to determine a uniform system for reporting the estimated rate impact of RES compliance. In its January 6, 2015 Order in Docket E999/CI-11-852,⁴ the Commission established reporting requirements for estimating the rate impact of RES compliance including:

- calculating the direct costs of renewable generation,
- adding the costs of any new transmission improvements needed for renewable power,
- subtracting costs of resources that would have been used in place of the renewable resources, and

⁴ *In the Matter of Utility Renewable Energy Cost Impact Reports Required by Minnesota Statutes Section 216B.1691, Subd. 2e*, Docket No. E999/CI-11-852, Order Establishing Uniform Reporting System for Estimating Rate Impact of Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, (January 6, 2015).

- discussing any impacts that renewable generation had on the utility's indirect costs (such as the effects on baseload generation facilities).

B. RES REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

1. Entities Subject to the RES Requirements

Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 1(b) defines an electric utility as “a public utility providing electric service, a generation and transmission cooperative electric association, a municipal power agency, or a power district.”

Based on the statutory definition of an electric utility, the Commission has determined that the following entities are subject to the RES Statute:

- Basin Electric Power Cooperative
- Central Minnesota Municipal Power Agency (CMMPA)
- Dairyland Power Cooperative
- East River Electric Cooperative
- Great River Energy (GRE)
- Heartland Consumer Power District
- Interstate Power and Light
- L&O Power Cooperative
- Minnkota Power Cooperative
- Minnesota Municipal Power Agency (MMPA)
- Minnesota Power
- Missouri River Energy Services
- Northwestern Wisconsin Electric Company
- Ottertail Power Company
- Southern Minnesota Municipal Power Agency (SMMPA)
- Xcel Energy

The definition of an electric utility contained in Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 1(b) was amended in 2007 to include a power district. Consequently, Heartland Consumer Power District is now subject to the RES requirements. In its November 12, 2008 Order in Docket No. E999/CI-03-869, the Commission found that East River Electric Power Cooperative and L&O Power Cooperative were required to file separate RES reporting.⁵ Prior to this Order, L&O and East River's RES compliance reporting was aggregated with the reporting from Basin Electric. Finally, given its limited presence in Minnesota, the Commission granted Northwestern Wisconsin Electric Company the discretion to report its renewable energy compliance information as provided to the Wisconsin Public Service Commission.

2. Determination of Generation Eligible for the Minnesota RES

Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 1 defines the types of renewable generation eligible for meeting the RES requirements, while Minn. Stat. §216B.1691, subd. 2(d) directs the Commission to “issue necessary orders detailing the criteria and standards by which it will measure an electric utility's

⁵ *In the Matter of Detailing Criteria and Standards for Measuring an Electric Utility's Good Faith Efforts in Meeting the Renewable Energy Objectives Under Minn. Stat. §216B.1691*, Docket No. E999/CI-03-869, Order Setting Filing Requirements and Clarifying Procedures, (November 12, 2008).

efforts to meet the renewable energy objectives of subdivision 2 to determine whether the utility is making the required good faith effort.”

The Commission set forth the criteria for determining compliance with the RES Statute after taking comments from affected parties in a number of Orders.⁶ Among the resources the Commission has determined ineligible for meeting the RES are resources used for green pricing, resources that do not meet the statutory definition of eligibility, and generation assigned to compliance for other regulatory purposes such as another state’s Renewable Portfolio Standard Requirements (RPS).

In addition to excluding ineligible generation from the reporting, a number of utilities have Power Purchase Agreements (PPAs) with renewable generators in which the ownership of the environmental attributes is unknown or silent. The M-RETS operating procedures define a renewable energy credit or REC as “representing all of the attributes from one MWh of electricity generation from a renewable generating unit registered with the M-RETS tracking system or a certificate imported from a compatible certificate tracking system and converted to an M-RETS Certificate.”

The renewable attributes associated with one MWh include all environmental attributes, credits, benefits, emission reductions, offsets, and allowances attributable to the renewable energy generation. The purpose of requiring registration of a “whole certificate,” that is one with all the environmental attributes, is to help ensure compliance with the statutory prohibition against double counting of the environmental benefits, and to ensure that ratepayers receive the benefits of the renewable energy for which they are paying through their rates.

Four companies reported having some PPAs for which the assignment of the RECs is not known: Great River Energy, Interstate Power & Light, Otter Tail Power Company, and Xcel Energy.

In a September 9, 2010 Order, the Minnesota Public Utilities Commission determined that Xcel owned the RECs for PPAs entered into pursuant to Minnesota’s wind and biomass statutory mandates, unless the generator could otherwise demonstrate that the PPA at issue is not silent as to REC ownership; and determined that for PPAs entered into pursuant to the Federal Public Utility Regulatory Policy Act (PURPA), the generators own the RECs.⁷ Xcel reports only one PPA amendment remains pending before the Commission to settle REC ownership issues.⁸

C. 2013 RES COMPLIANCE

On June 1, 2014, utilities subject to the RES Statute filed their compliance reports with the Commission (Docket No. E999/PR-14-12). Minn. Stat. §216B.1691 currently requires Xcel to obtain 18 percent of its Minnesota retail sales from renewables, and all other utilities subject to RES requirements to obtain 12 percent of their Minnesota retail sales from renewables. Table 1, below, summarizes utility compliance with the 2013 requirements. All of the utilities subject to the RES Statute have demonstrated compliance with the 2013 RES requirements.

⁶ See footnote 1.

⁷ *In the Matter of Xcel Energy’s Petition for a Determination of Entitlement to Renewable Attributes of Energy Purchases Pursuant to Renewable Energy Requirements*, Docket No. E002/M-08-440, Order Determining Ownership of Renewable Energy Credits for Power Purchase Agreements Made Pursuant to State Wind and Biomass Statutes and the Federal Public Utility Regulatory Policy Act (September 9, 2010).

⁸ Xcel Compliance Filing in Docket E002/M-08-440 (December 12, 2012).

Table 1: 2013 RES Compliance

Utility	2013 Minnesota Retail Sales (MWhs)	Total RECs Retired (for MN Retail Sales)	Percent
Basin Electric	677,283	81,274	12%
Central MN Municipal Power Agency (CMMPA)	317,296	38,079	12%
Dairyland Power Cooperative	819,506	98,343	12%
East River Power Cooperative	412,148	49,567	12%
Great River Energy	11,267,383	1,352,086	12%
Heartland Power District	643,180	77,183	12%
Interstate Power & Light	857,965	102,956	12%
L & O Power Cooperative	156,501	18,781	12%
Minnesota Municipal Power Agency (MMPA)	10,097,896	1,211,748	12%
Minnesota Power	1,618,100	192,172	12%
Minnkota Power Cooperative	1,426,534	171,523	12%
Missouri River Energy Services (MRES)	1,355,896	162,708	12%
Northwestern Wisconsin Power ⁹	556	See footnote 9	
Otter Tail Power Company	2,164,446	259,734	12%
Southern MN Municipal Power Agency	2,928,597	351,432	12%
Xcel Energy	<u>30,954,277</u>	<u>5,571,770</u>	18%
Total (weighted average)	65,697,008	9,741,353	15%

D. ABILITY TO COMPLY WITH RES REQUIREMENTS IN THE FUTURE

As noted above, in 2013, the RES requirement was 18 percent of Minnesota retail sales for Xcel Energy, and 12 percent of Minnesota retail sales for all other utilities subject to the requirement. The RES requirements had increased in 2012 from 7 percent of Minnesota retail sales to 12 percent of Minnesota retail sales for all utilities except Xcel Energy. Utilities may retire RECs towards RES compliance up to four years from the date of generation. In addition, utilities may purchase excess RECs from other utilities to meet their RES requirement, or reallocate RECs to Minnesota from their other state jurisdictions with lower RES requirements. To date, only Iowa, Wisconsin and Minnesota have Renewable Energy Standards in place. A Renewable Energy Objective of 10 percent will be in place for both North and South Dakota beginning in 2015.

As part of their biennial reporting, utilities were asked to provide the year through which the Company can maintain its RES compliance with its current renewable portfolio. Table 2, below, summarizes the year through which the utilities expect to comply with the RES.

⁹ Per the Commission's November 12, 2008 Order in Docket No. E999/CI-03-869, Northwestern Wisconsin Electric is permitted to comply with the Minnesota reporting requirements by submitting its renewable energy compliance information as reported to the Wisconsin Public Service Commission. Northwestern Wisconsin submitted its Wisconsin RPS compliance report indicating it retired 24,367 RECs towards its compliance in Wisconsin.

Table 2: Estimated Year through which the Utility can comply with RES

Utility	Compliance through year
Basin Electric	2025
Central MN Municipal Power Agency (CMMPA)	2027
Dairyland Power Cooperative	2025
East River Power Cooperative	2025
Great River Energy	2027
Heartland Power District	2029
Interstate Power & Light	2013 before the reallocation of RECs assigned to Iowa
L&O Power Cooperative	2025
Minnesota Municipal Power Agency (MMPA)	2039
Minnesota Power	2025
Minnkota Power Cooperative	2021
Missouri River Energy Services (MRES)	2019
Northwest Wisconsin	See footnote 8
Otter Tail Power Company	2028
Southern MN Municipal Power Agency	2020
Xcel Energy	2023

Although Interstate Power & Light does not have excess RECs currently allocated to Minnesota, it has sizeable REC holdings assigned to its Iowa jurisdiction that are far in excess of its RES requirements in Iowa that can be reallocated to Minnesota for RES compliance.

All of the utilities appear positioned to comply with their RES requirements well into the future.

E. OBSTACLES AND POTENTIAL SOLUTIONS FOR MEETING THE RES REQUIREMENTS

The utilities provided comments on obstacles they have encountered or anticipate encountering to meeting the RES requirements. Seven of the utilities indicated that they had not experienced obstacles in compliance. Transmission constraints and the lead time for new transmission projects, siting concerns, and concerns over the renewal of the Production Tax Credit (PTC) and Investment Tax Credit (ITC) continue to be the concerns most frequently cited by utilities. One utility cited the increased reliance on natural gas facilities as a backup to intermittent renewable resources, and expressed concern that increasing demand from multiple uses (industrial, home heating and electric industries) could eventually result in higher natural gas prices that would impact ratepayers. Other utilities indicated that current lower natural gas prices were reducing the relative cost-effectiveness of wind energy.

Utilities indicated that MISO's reforms to its process for studying electrical engineering aspects of interconnecting new electric infrastructure (including new renewable generation projects) helped alleviate some of the long lag times for studies. The development of the CAPX2020 transmission lines is anticipated to reduce transmission constraints.

II. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

While some utilities faced certain obstacles in meeting their RES requirements, the Minnesota Department of Commerce concludes that utilities complied with their 2013 obligations, and appear

able to comply into the future. Commerce notes that the official determination as to whether utilities are complying with Minn. Stat. §216B.1691 is the responsibility of the Commission.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Sharon Ferguson, hereby certify that I have this day, served copies of the following document on the attached list of persons by electronic filing, certified mail, e-mail, or by depositing a true and correct copy thereof properly enveloped with postage paid in the United States Mail at St. Paul, Minnesota.

**Minnesota Department of Commerce
Report to the Minnesota Legislature**

Docket No. E999/M-14-237

Dated this 28th day of January 2015

/s/Sharon Ferguson

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Julia	Anderson	Julia.Anderson@ag.state.mn.us	Office of the Attorney General-DOC	1800 BRM Tower 445 Minnesota St St. Paul, MN 551012134	Electronic Service	Yes	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Christopher	Anderson	canderson@allete.com	Minnesota Power	30 W Superior St Duluth, MN 558022191	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Derek	Bertsch	derek.bertsch@mrenergy.com	Missouri River Energy Services	3724 West Avera Drive PO Box 88920 Sioux Falls, SD 57109-8920	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
William A.	Blazar	bblazar@mnchamber.com	Minnesota Chamber Of Commerce	Suite 1500 400 Robert Street North St. Paul, MN 55101	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Michael	Bradley	mike.bradley@lawmoss.com	Moss & Barnett	150 S. 5th Street, #1200 Minneapolis, MN 55402	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Jon	Brekke	jbrekke@greenergy.com	Great River Energy	12300 Elm Creek Boulevard Maple Grove, MN 553694718	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Mark B.	Bring	mbring@otpc.com	Otter Tail Power Company	215 South Cascade Street PO Box 496 Fergus Falls, MN 565380496	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Christina	Brusven	cbrusven@fredlaw.com	Fredrikson Byron	200 S 6th St Ste 4000 Minneapolis, MN 554021425	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Tammie	Carino	tcarino@GREnergy.com	Great River Energy	12300 Elm Creek Blvd. Maple Grove, MN 55369-4718	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Douglas M.	Carnival	dmc@mcgrannshea.com	McGrann Shea Carnival Straughn & Lamb	N/A	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Kenneth A.	Colburn	kcolburn@symbioticstrategies.com	Symbiotic Strategies, LLC	26 Winton Road Meredith, NH 32535413	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
George	Crocker	gwillc@nawo.org	North American Water Office	PO Box 174 Lake Elmo, MN 55042	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
David	Dahlberg	davedahlberg@nweco.com	Northwestern Wisconsin Electric Company	P.O. Box 9 104 South Pine Street Grantsburg, WI 548400009	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Curt	Dieren	bademailcdieren@dgrnet.com	L&O Power Cooperative	1302 South Union Street PO Box 511 Rock Rapids, IA 51246	Paper Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Ian	Dobson	ian.dobson@ag.state.mn.us	Office of the Attorney General-RUD	Antitrust and Utilities Division 445 Minnesota Street, BRM Tower St. Paul, MN 55101	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Mike	Eggl	megg1@bepc.com	Basin Electric Power Cooperative	1717 East Interstate Avenue Bismarck, ND 58503	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Kristen	Eide Tollefson	HealingSystems@earthlink.net	R-CURE	P O Box 129 Frontenac, MN 55026	Paper Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Oncu	Er	oncu.er@avantenergy.com	Avant Energy, Agent for MMPA	220 S. Sixth St. Ste. 1300 Minneapolis, MN 55402	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Sharon	Ferguson	sharon.ferguson@state.mn.us	Department of Commerce	85 7th Place E Ste 500 Saint Paul, MN 551012198	Electronic Service	Yes	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Cathy	Fogale	cfogale@otpc.com	Otter Tail Power Company	215 South Cascade Street PO Box 496 Fergus Falls, MN 56537	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Amy	Fredregill	amy@mrets.org	Midwest Renewable Energy Tracking System, Inc.	1885 University Avenue West, #315 St. Paul, MN 55104	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Gary	Garbe	Gary.Garbe@avantenergy.com	Minnesota Municipal Power Agency	220 South Sixth Street Suite 1300 Minneapolis, MN 55402	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Edward	Garvey	garveyed@aol.com	Residence	32 Lawton St Saint Paul, MN 55102	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Benjamin	Gerber	bgerber@mnychamber.com	Minnesota Chamber of Commerce	400 Robert Street North Suite 1500 St. Paul, Minnesota 55101	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Bryan	Gower	N/A	APX, Inc.	224 Airport Parkway Suite 600 San Jose, CA 95110	Paper Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Michael	Greiveldinger	michaelgreiveldinger@alliantenergy.com	Interstate Power and Light Company	4902 N. Biltmore Lane Madison, WI 53718	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Tony	Hainault	anthony.hainault@co.hennepin.mn.us	Hennepin County DES	701 4th Ave S Ste 700 Minneapolis, MN 55415-1842	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Bill	Heaney	billheaney@billheaney.com	IBEW Minnesota State Council	940 44th Ave NE Unite 21067 Columbia Hts, MN 55421-3099	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
John	Helmerts	helmerts.john@co.olmsted.mn.us	Olmsted County Waste to Energy	2122 Campus Drive SE Rochester, MN 55904-4744	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Jared	Hendricks	hendricksj@owatonnautilities.com	Owatonna Public Utilities	PO Box 800 208 S Walnut Ave Owatonna, MN 55060-2940	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Annete	Henkel	mui@mutilityinvestors.org	Minnesota Utility Investors	413 Wacouta Street #230 St. Paul, MN 55101	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Jessy	Hennesy	jessy.hennesy@avantenergy.com	Avant Energy	220 S. Sixth St. Ste 1300 Minneapolis, Minnesota 55402	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Ashley	Houston			120 Fairway Rd Chestnut Hill, MA 24671850	Paper Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Lori	Hoyum	lhoyum@mnpower.com	Minnesota Power	30 West Superior Street Duluth, MN 55802	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Tiffany	Hughes	Regulatory.Records@xcelenergy.com	Xcel Energy	414 Nicollet Mall FL 7 Minneapolis, MN 554011993	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Casey	Jacobson	cjacobson@bepc.com	Basin Electric Power Cooperative	1717 East Interstate Avenue Bismarck, ND 58501	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Eric	Jensen	ejensen@iwla.org	Izaak Walton League of America	Suite 202 1619 Dayton Avenue St. Paul, MN 55104	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Larry	Johnston	lw.johnston@smmpa.org	SMMPA	500 1st Ave SW Rochester, MN 55902-3303	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Nate	Jones	njones@hcpd.com	Heartland Consumers Power	PO Box 248 Madison, SD 57042	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Julie	Ketchum	N/A	Waste Management	20520 Keokuk Ave Lakeville, MN 55044	Paper Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Deborah Fohr	Levchak	dlevchak@bepec.com	Basin Electric Power Cooperative	1717 East Interstate Avenue Bismarck, ND 585030564	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
John	Lindell	agorud.ecf@ag.state.mn.us	Office of the Attorney General-RUD	1400 BRM Tower 445 Minnesota St St. Paul, MN 551012130	Electronic Service	Yes	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Mark	Lindquist	N/A	The Minnesota Project	57107 422nd St New Ulm, MN 56073-4321	Paper Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Dave	McNary	N/A	Hennepin County DES	701 Fourth Avenue South suite 700 Minneapolis, MN 55415-1842	Paper Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
John	McWilliams	jmm@dairynet.com	Dairyland Power Cooperative	3200 East Ave SPO Box 817 La Crosse, WI 54601-7227	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Stacy	Miller	stacy.miller@state.mn.us	Department of Commerce	State Energy Office 85 7th Place East, Suite 500 St. Paul, MN 55101	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
David	Moeller	dmoeller@allete.com	Minnesota Power	30 W Superior St Duluth, MN 558022093	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Andrew	Moratzka	apmoratzka@stoel.com	Stoel Rives LLP	33 South Sixth Street Suite 4200 Minneapolis, MN 55402	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties
Ben	Nelson		CMMPA	459 South Grove Street Blue Earth, MN 56013	Paper Service	No	SPL_SL_14-237_Interested Parties

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
David W.	Niles	david.niles@avantenergy.com	Minnesota Municipal Power Agency	Suite 300 200 South Sixth Street Minneapolis, MN 55402	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Russell	Olson	N/A	Heartland Consumers Power District	PO Box 248 Madison, SD 570420248	Paper Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Mary Beth	Peranteau	mperanteau@wheelerlaw.com	Wheeler Van Sickle & Anderson SC	Suite 801 25 West Main Street Madison, WI 537033398	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Mark	Rathbun	mrathbun@greenergy.com	Great River Energy	12300 Elm Creek Blvd Maple Grove, MN 55369	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
John C.	Reinhardt		Laura A. Reinhardt	3552 26Th Avenue South Minneapolis, MN 55406	Paper Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Kevin	Reuther	kreuther@mncenter.org	MN Center for Environmental Advocacy	26 E Exchange St, Ste 206 St. Paul, MN 551011667	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Craig	Rustad	crustad@minnkota.com	Minnkota Power	1822 Mill Road PO Box 13200 Grand Forks, ND 582083200	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Robert K.	Sahr	bsahr@eastriver.coop	East River Electric Power Cooperative	P.O. Box 227 Madison, SD 57042	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Richard	Savelkoul	rsavelkoul@martinsquires.com	Martin & Squires, P.A.	332 Minnesota Street Ste W2750 St. Paul, MN 55101	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Matthew J.	Schuerger P.E.	mjsreg@earthlink.net	Energy Systems Consulting Services, LLC	PO Box 16129 St. Paul, MN 55116	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Dean	Sedgwick	N/A	Itasca Power Company	PO Box 457 Bigfork, MN 56628-0457	Paper Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Mrg	Simon	mrgsimon@mrenergy.com	Missouri River Energy Services	3724 W. Avera Drive P.O. Box 88920 Sioux Falls, SD 571098920	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Beth H.	Soholt	bsoholt@windonthewires.org	Wind on the Wires	570 Asbury Street Suite 201 St. Paul, MN 55104	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Steve	Thompson	stevet@cmmpa.org	Central Minnesota Municipal Power Agency	459 S Grove St Blue Earth, MN 56013-2629	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Pat	Treseler	pat.jcplaw@comcast.net	Paulson Law Office LTD	Suite 325 7301 Ohms Lane Edina, MN 55439	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Darryl	Tveitbakk		Northern Municipal Power Agency	123 Second Street West Thief River Falls, MN 56701	Paper Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Roger	Warehime	warehimer@owatonnautilities.com	Owatonna Public Utilities	208 South Walnut PO Box 800 Owatonna, MN 55060	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Paul	White	paul.white@prcwind.com	Project Resources Corp./Tamarac Line LLC/Ridgewind	618 2nd Ave SE Minneapolis, MN 55414	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Robyn	Woeste	robynwoeste@alliantenergy.com	Interstate Power and Light Company	200 First St SE Cedar Rapids, IA 52401	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties
Daniel	Wolf	dan.wolf@state.mn.us	Public Utilities Commission	Suite 350 121 7th Place East St. Paul, MN 551022147	Electronic Service	Yes	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Thomas J.	Zaremba	TZaremba@wheelerlaw.com	WHEELER, VAN SICKLE & ANDERSON	Suite 801 25 West Main Street Madison, WI 537033398	Electronic Service	No	SPL_SL_14- 237_Interested Parties