

Christopher D. Anderson Associate General Counsel 218-723-3961 e-mail canderson@allete.com

November 11, 2014

## VIA ELECTRONIC FILING

Dr. Burl W. Haar Executive Secretary Minnesota Public Utilities Commission 121 7<sup>th</sup> Place East, Suite 350 St. Paul, MN 55101-2147

Re: In the Matter of a Commission Inquiry into

Decommissioning Policies Related to Depreciation

Docket No, E,G-999/CI-13-626

Dear Dr. Haar:

Minnesota Power hereby electronically submits its Reply Comments in the above-referenced Docket.

Please contact me at the number above should you have any questions related to this matter.

Yours truly,

Christopher D. Anderson

CDA:sr

cc: Official Service List



## STATE OF MINNESOTA BEFORE THE MINNESOTA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

In the Matter of a Commission Inquiry into Decommissioning Policies Related to Depreciation Docket No. E,G-999/CI-13-626

REPLY COMMENTS

Minnesota Power files these Reply Comments in response to Comments filed by the Minnesota Department of Commerce, Division of Energy Resources ("Department") dated October 10, 2014.

As stated in Minnesota Power's Comments to Docket No. E-G 999/CI-13-626, dated April 7, 2014, the decommissioning probability is the likelihood of actually decommissioning the unit at the end of its remaining life. Generally decommissioning probability increases along with a significant life extension as the longer Minnesota Power anticipates operating an asset, particularly a coal fired generating plant, the greater the likelihood exists that the asset will be decommissioned at the end of its currently estimated remaining life. A primary driver for why decommissioning is more likely to occur in (for example) 2035 versus 2020 is due to a greater likelihood of future emission controls and expected operating costs for large coal fired units. As stated in its Comments, Minnesota Power believes that the Department has previously supported decommissioning probabilities and believes the use of probabilities in decommissioning studies is still valid today. Minnesota Power also noted in its Comments that if it is determined that decommissioning probability should always be set to 100 percent in all cases, Minnesota Power proposes the impact of the additional depreciation expense as a result of this change be deferred until the Company's next rate case.

The Department's recommendation is that the Commission require utilities to cease using decommissioning probabilities on a going-forward basis. The Department also states that if the Commission agrees with this recommendation, it may wish to

1

consider the financial impact this change will have on MP in determining whether to require the utility to make this change before their next rate case. The Department notes that MP has provided estimates of the impact that elimination of decommissioning probabilities would have on its annual depreciation expense in recent depreciation filings. In Docket No. E015/D-14-318, MP estimated that it would increase depreciation expense by \$2.2 million, or roughly 3.5 percent.

In conclusion, if the Commission agrees with the Department's recommendation that the Commission require utilities to cease using decommissioning probabilities, on a going-forward basis, Minnesota Power requests the impact of the additional depreciation expense as a result of this change be deferred until the Company's next rate case or that the Department's recommendation be implemented in conjunction with the Company's next rate case.

Date: November 11, 2014 Re

Respectfully submitted,

Christopher D. Anderson Associate General Counsel Minnesota Power 30 West Superior Street Duluth, MN 55802

218-723-3961

canderson@allete.com

STATE OF MINNESOTA	)	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE VIA
	) ss	ELECTRONIC FILING
COUNTY OF ST. LOUIS	)	

Susan Romans of the City of Duluth, County of St. Louis, State of Minnesota, says that on the 11th day of November, 2014, she served Minnesota Power's Reply Comments in Docket No. E,G-999/CI-13-626 to the Minnesota Public Utilities Commission and the Energy Resources Division of the Minnesota Department of Commerce via electronic filing. The remaining parties on the attached official service list were served as indicated.

**Susan Romans** 

Dwan Komans

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
David	Aafedt	daafedt@winthrop.com	Winthrop & Weinstine, P.A.	Suite 3500, 225 South Sixth Street Minneapolis, MN	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
				554024629			
Michael	Ahern	ahern.michael@dorsey.co m	Dorsey & Whitney, LLP	50 S 6th St Ste 1500  Minneapolis, MN 554021498	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Julia	Anderson	Julia.Anderson@ag.state.m n.us	Office of the Attorney General-DOC	1800 BRM Tower 445 Minnesota St St. Paul, MN 551012134	Electronic Service	Yes	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Peter	Beithon	pbeithon@otpco.com	Otter Tail Power Company	P.O. Box 496 215 South Cascade S Fergus Falls, MN 565380496	Electronic Service treet	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Christina	Brusven	cbrusven@fredlaw.com	Fredrikson & Byron, P.A.	200 S 6th St Ste 4000  Minneapolis, MN 554021425	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Jeffrey A.	Daugherty	jeffrey.daugherty@centerp ointenergy.com	CenterPoint Energy	800 LaSalle Ave  Minneapolis,  MN  55402	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
lan	Dobson	ian.dobson@ag.state.mn.u s	Office of the Attorney General-RUD	Antitrust and Utilities Division 445 Minnesota Street, BRM Tower St. Paul, MN 55101	Electronic Service 1400	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Sharon	Ferguson	sharon.ferguson@state.mn .us	Department of Commerce	85 7th Place E Ste 500  Saint Paul, MN 551012198	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Edward	Garvey	garveyed@aol.com	Residence	32 Lawton St Saint Paul, MN 55102	Paper Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Elizabeth	Goodpaster	bgoodpaster@mncenter.or g	MN Center for Environmental Advocacy	Suite 206 26 East Exchange Str St. Paul, MN 551011667	Electronic Service eet	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Burl W.	Haar	burl.haar@state.mn.us	Public Utilities Commission	Suite 350 121 7th Place East St. Paul, MN 551012147	Electronic Service	Yes	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Eric	Jensen	ejensen@iwla.org	Izaak Walton League of America	Suite 202 1619 Dayton Avenue St. Paul, MN 55104	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Nicolle	Kupser	nkupser@greatermngas.co m	Greater Minnesota Gas, Inc.	202 South Main Street P.O. Box 68 Le Sueur, MN 56058	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Douglas	Larson	dlarson@dakotaelectric.co m	Dakota Electric Association	4300 220th St W Farmington, MN 55024	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
John	Lindell	agorud.ecf@ag.state.mn.us	Office of the Attorney General-RUD	1400 BRM Tower 445 Minnesota St St. Paul, MN 551012130	Electronic Service	Yes	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Pam	Marshall	pam@energycents.org	Energy CENTS Coalition	823 7th St E  St. Paul,  MN  55106	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Brian	Meloy	brian.meloy@stinsonleonar d.com	Stinson,Leonard, Street LLP	150 S 5th St Ste 2300 Minneapolis, MN 55402	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
David	Moeller	dmoeller@allete.com	Minnesota Power	30 W Superior St  Duluth, MN 558022093	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Andrew	Moratzka	apmoratzka@stoel.com	Stoel Rives LLP	33 South Sixth Street Suite 4200 Minneapolis, MN 55402	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Greg	Palmer	gpalmer@greatermngas.co m	Greater Minnesota Gas, Inc.	PO Box 68 202 South Main Street Le Sueur, MN 56058	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Kim	Pederson	kpederson@otpco.com	Otter Tail Power Company	215 S Cascade St PO Box 496 Fergus Falls, MN 565380496	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Kent	Ragsdale	kentragsdale@alliantenerg y.com	Alliant Energy-Interstate Power and Light Company	P.O. Box 351 200 First Street, SE Cedar Rapids, IA 524060351	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Richard	Savelkoul	rsavelkoul@martinsquires.com	Martin & Squires, P.A.	332 Minnesota Street Ste W2750 St. Paul, MN 55101	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Ron	Spangler, Jr.	rlspangler@otpco.com	Otter Tail Power Company	215 So. Cascade St. PO Box 496 Fergus Falls, MN 565380496	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Erin	Stojan Ruccolo	ruccolo@fresh-energy.org	Fresh Energy	408 Saint Peter St Ste 220 Saint Paul, MN 55102-1125	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
James M.	Strommen	jstrommen@kennedy- graven.com	Kennedy & Graven, Chartered	470 U.S. Bank Plaza 200 South Sixth Stree Minneapolis, MN 55402	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Eric	Swanson	eswanson@winthrop.com	Winthrop Weinstine	225 S 6th St Ste 3500 Capella Tower Minneapolis, MN 554024629	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
SaGonna	Thompson	Regulatory.Records@xcele nergy.com	Xcel Energy	414 Nicollet Mall FL 7  Minneapolis, MN 554011993	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Gregory	Walters	gjwalters@minnesotaenerg yresources.com	Minnesota Energy Resources Corporation	3460 Technology Dr. NW  Rochester, MN 55901	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Robyn	Woeste	robynwoeste@alliantenerg y.com	Interstate Power and Light Company	200 First St SE  Cedar Rapids, IA 52401	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Kurt	Yeager	kyeager@galvinpower.org	Galvin Electricity Initiative	3412 Hillview Avenue	Paper Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
				Palo Alto, CA 94304			