

Christopher D. Anderson Associate General Counsel 218-723-3961 e-mail canderson@allete.com

July 30, 2014

#### VIA ELECTRONIC FILING

Dr. Burl W. Haar Executive Secretary Minnesota Public Utilities Commission 121 7<sup>th</sup> Place East, Suite 350 St. Paul, MN 55101-2147

Re: In the Matter of a Commission Inquiry into

Decommissioning Policies Related to Depreciation

Docket No, E,G-999/CI-13-626

Dear Dr. Haar:

Pursuant to the Minnesota Public Utilities Commission Notice of Comment Period dated March 6, 2014, Minnesota Power hereby electronically submits its Comments in the above-referenced Docket.

Please contact me at the number above should you have any questions related to this matter.

Yours truly,

Christopher D. Anderson

CDA:sr

cc: Official Service List



# STATE OF MINNESOTA BEFORE THE MINNESOTA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

In the Matter of a Commission Inquiry into Decommissioning Policies Related to Depreciation

Docket No. E,G-999/CI-13-626

**Topics Open for Comment** 

Minnesota Power files this information in response to the Notice of Comment Period on Decommissioning Cost Investigation in the Matter of a Commission Inquiry into Decommissioning Policies Related to Depreciation filed by the Minnesota Public Utilities Commission ("Commission") dated May 16, 2014.

### **Topics Open for Comment:**

1) Provide reasons and descriptions of why the Utility does or does not adjust decommissioning estimates based on expected inflation, and what impact this has on decommissioning estimates over time.

Minnesota Power does not adjust decommissioning estimates based on expected inflation. Decommissioning costs are in today's dollars. Decommissioning estimates will change over time due to many factors.

- 2) Provide the following data, reaching as far back in time as practicable, for each of the Utility's plants and units.
  - a. Annual decommissioning accruals by plant or unit;
  - b. The decommissioning estimate used to calculate each annual accrual;
  - c. The decommissioning probability used to calculate each accrual.

See the attached spreadsheet "Generic Docket Topic 2.xlsx" for the requested information.

3) Specific to Xcel Energy: Provide an explanation whether decommissioning uncertainty is addressed in a different manner in Wisconsin. If so, please explain the method used. If not, explain whether the Company has ever proposed the use of decommissioning probabilities in Wisconsin and the reasons the use of decommissioning probabilities was denied.

N/A

4) Specific to Minnesota Power: Minnesota Power's position is that the decommissioning study from a utility's most recently approved resource plan should serve as the basis for the decommissioning study used to support its depreciation petition. If a utility has a resource plan before the Commission at the time it files a depreciation petition, the decommissioning assumptions used in the resource plan should not be used in the depreciation petition because those depreciation assumptions are dependent on Commission action. Provide clarification of its position on how decommissioning assumptions used in resource plans are dependent on Commission action.

On May 23, 2014 the Company submitted a letter in compliance with Docket No. E-015/D-13-275 related to the Company's 2013 Remaining Life Petition. Through the course of resolving the issues raised by the Department in that docket, the Company's position has been clarified. The Company acknowledges that the 2011 Baseload Diversification Study used in the 2010 IRP was not used in the 2013 Remaining Life Depreciation Petition resulting in inconsistency between our filings. The Company understands the importance of ensuring consistency from one filing to the next. In the future the Company will ensure that information from one filing to the next is consistently applied or the reasons for any changes to that approach adequately explained. For example, if our next resource plan includes an updated decommissioning study and is filed before our next depreciation petition, the decommissioning study used in the resource plan would generally be incorporated into the depreciation petition for consistency in our

filings. If a different decommissioning study was used or changes were made, adequate explanations for changes would be provided.

Dated: July 30, 2014 Respectfully submitted,

Christopher D. Anderson Associate General Counsel

Minnesota Power 30 West Superior Street

Duluth, MN 55802 218-723-3961

canderson@allete.com

## **Generic Docket Topic 2.xlsx**

|                                 | 2008            |                  |                  |                 | 2009             |                  | 2010            |                  |                  |  |
|---------------------------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------|--|
|                                 | Annual          |                  |                  | Annual          |                  | _                | Annual          |                  |                  |  |
|                                 | Decommissioning | Decommissioining | Decommissioining | Decommissioning | Decommissioining | Decommissioining | Decommissioning | Decommissioining | Decommissioining |  |
|                                 | Accruals        | Estimate 1)      | Probability 2)   | Accruals        | Estimate 1)      | Probability 2)   | Accruals        | Estimate 1)      | Probability 2)   |  |
| Boswell Energy Center Unit 1    | 7,314           | 1,173,877        | 50%              | 24,668          | 1,659,770        | 50%              | 21,379          | 1,659,770        | 50%              |  |
| Boswell Energy Center Unit 2    | 9,810           | 1,130,974        | 50%              | 26,547          | 1,599,590        | 50%              | 23,007          | 1,599,590        | 50%              |  |
| Boswell Energy Center Unit 3    | 319,300         | 16,083,051       | 75%              | 507,760         | 22,616,338       | 75%              | 583,600         | 25,144,338       | 75%              |  |
| Boswell Energy Center Unit 4    | 200,294         | 19,242,310       | 50%              | 396,014         | 27,071,100       | 50%              | 289,395         | 27,071,100       | 50%              |  |
| Boswell Energy Center Common    | 8,441           | 4,427,706        | 50%              | 56,863          | 6,219,344        | 50%              | 49,755          | 6,219,344        | 50%              |  |
| Laskin Energy Center            | 131,502         | 7,382,216        | 100%             | 216,647         | 8,574,264        | 100%             | 187,761         | 8,574,264        | 100%             |  |
| Taconite Harbor Energy Center   | 265,394         | 6,634,859        | 80%              | 265,394         | 6,634,859        | 80%              | 265,394         | 6,634,859        | 80%              |  |
| Hibbard Renewable Energy Center |                 |                  |                  |                 |                  | -                |                 |                  | -                |  |
| Total                           | 942,055         | 56,074,993       |                  | 1,493,893       | 74,375,265       | _                | 1,420,291       | 76,903,265       | _                |  |

<sup>1)</sup> The decommissioning estimate used to calculate the annual decommissioning accrual

<sup>2)</sup> The decommissioning probability used

## **Generic Docket Topic 2.xlsx**

|                                 | 2011            |                  |                  |                 | 2012             |                  | 2013            |                  |                  |
|---------------------------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------|
|                                 | Annual          |                  |                  | Annual          | Annual           |                  | Annual          | Annual           |                  |
|                                 | Decommissioning | Decommissioining | Decommissioining | Decommissioning | Decommissioining | Decommissioining | Decommissioning | Decommissioining | Decommissioining |
|                                 | Accruals        | Estimate 1)      | Probability 2)   | Accruals        | Estimate 1)      | Probability 2)   | Accruals        | Estimate 1)      | Probability 2)   |
| Boswell Energy Center Unit 1    | 21,379          | 1,659,770        | 50%              | 21,378          | 1,659,770        | 50%              | 215,330         | 6,314,600        | 50%              |
| Boswell Energy Center Unit 2    | 23,007          | 1,599,590        | 50%              | 23,007          | 1,599,590        | 50%              | 224,816         | 6,443,000        | 50%              |
| Boswell Energy Center Unit 3    | 583,600         | 25,144,338       | 75%              | 583,600         | 25,144,338       | 75%              | 734,652         | 29,575,200       | 75%              |
| Boswell Energy Center Unit 4    | 289,395         | 27,071,100       | 50%              | 289,395         | 27,071,100       | 50%              | 448,599         | 34,394,480       | 50%              |
| Boswell Energy Center Common    | 49,755          | 6,219,344        | 50%              | 49,755          | 6,219,344        | 50%              | 164,817         | 10,131,451       | 50%              |
| Laskin Energy Center            | 187,761         | 8,574,264        | 100%             | 187,761         | 8,574,264        | 100%             | 426,905         | 11,444,000       | 100%             |
| Taconite Harbor Energy Center   | 265,394         | 6,634,859        | 80%              | 265,394         | 6,634,859        | 80%              | 508,888         | 10,896,000       | 80%              |
| Hibbard Renewable Energy Center |                 |                  |                  |                 |                  |                  |                 |                  |                  |
| Total                           | 1,420,291       | 76,903,265       |                  | 1,420,290       | 76,903,265       |                  | 2,724,007       | 109,198,731      |                  |

<sup>1)</sup> The decommissioning estimate used to calculate the annual decommissioning accrual

<sup>2)</sup> The decommissioning probability used

|                                 | 2014            |                  |                  |  |  |  |  |  |
|---------------------------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
|                                 | Annual          |                  |                  |  |  |  |  |  |
|                                 | Decommissioning | Decommissioining | Decommissioining |  |  |  |  |  |
|                                 | Accruals        | Estimate 1)      | Probability 2)   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Boswell Energy Center Unit 1    | 186,723         | 5,685,255        | 50%              |  |  |  |  |  |
| Boswell Energy Center Unit 2    | 190,373         | 5,685,255        | 50%              |  |  |  |  |  |
| Boswell Energy Center Unit 3    | 643,150         | 27,013,141       | 75%              |  |  |  |  |  |
| Boswell Energy Center Unit 4    | 412,337         | 32,798,976       | 50%              |  |  |  |  |  |
| Boswell Energy Center Common    | 79,688          | 7,407,312        | 50%              |  |  |  |  |  |
| Laskin Energy Center            | 283,527         | 11,568,000       | 100%             |  |  |  |  |  |
| Taconite Harbor Energy Center   | 333,073         | 8,039,000        | 80%              |  |  |  |  |  |
| Hibbard Renewable Energy Center | 191,285         | 4,208,273        | 50%              |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total                           | 2,320,156       | 102,405,212      |                  |  |  |  |  |  |

<sup>1)</sup> The decommissioning estimate used to calculate the annual decommissioning accrual

<sup>2)</sup> The decommissioning probability used

| STATE OF MINNESOTA  | )    | AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE VIA |
|---------------------|------|--------------------------|
|                     | ) ss | ELECTRONIC FILING        |
| COUNTY OF ST. LOUIS | )    |                          |
|                     |      |                          |
|                     |      |                          |
|                     |      |                          |

Susan Romans of the City of Duluth, County of St. Louis, State of Minnesota, says that on the 30<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2014, she served Minnesota Power's Comments in Docket No. E,G-999/CI-13-626 to the Minnesota Public Utilities Commission and the Energy Resources Division of the Minnesota Department of Commerce via electronic filing. The remaining parties on the attached official service list were served as indicated.

**Susan Romans** 

Duran Komans

| First Name | Last Name  | Email                                       | Company Name                            | Address   | Delivery Method             | View Trade Secret | Service List Name      |
|------------|------------|---|---|---|-----------------------------|-------------------|------------------------|
| David      | Aafedt     | daafedt@winthrop.com                        | Winthrop & Weinstine, P.A.              | Suite 3500, 225 South<br>Sixth Street  Minneapolis, MN  | Electronic Service          | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
|            |            |   |   | 554024629   |                             |                   |                        |
| Michael    | Ahern      | ahern.michael@dorsey.co<br>m                | Dorsey & Whitney, LLP                   | 50 S 6th St Ste 1500  Minneapolis, MN 554021498   | Electronic Service          | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Julia      | Anderson   | Julia.Anderson@ag.state.m<br>n.us           | Office of the Attorney<br>General-DOC   | 1800 BRM Tower<br>445 Minnesota St<br>St. Paul,<br>MN<br>551012134                                    | Electronic Service          | Yes               | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Peter      | Beithon    | pbeithon@otpco.com                          | Otter Tail Power Company                | P.O. Box 496<br>215 South Cascade S<br>Fergus Falls,<br>MN<br>565380496                               | Electronic Service<br>treet | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Christina  | Brusven    | cbrusven@fredlaw.com                        | Fredrikson & Byron, P.A.                | 200 S 6th St Ste 4000  Minneapolis, MN 554021425  | Electronic Service          | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Jeffrey A. | Daugherty  | jeffrey.daugherty@centerp<br>ointenergy.com | CenterPoint Energy                      | 800 LaSalle Ave  Minneapolis,  MN  55402  | Electronic Service          | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| lan        | Dobson     | ian.dobson@ag.state.mn.u<br>s               | Office of the Attorney<br>General-RUD   | Antitrust and Utilities<br>Division<br>445 Minnesota Street,<br>BRM Tower<br>St. Paul,<br>MN<br>55101 | Electronic Service<br>1400  | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Sharon     | Ferguson   | sharon.ferguson@state.mn<br>.us             | Department of Commerce                  | 85 7th Place E Ste 500  Saint Paul, MN 551012198  | Electronic Service          | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Edward     | Garvey     | garveyed@aol.com                            | Residence                               | 32 Lawton St Saint Paul, MN 55102   | Paper Service               | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Elizabeth  | Goodpaster | bgoodpaster@mncenter.or<br>g                | MN Center for<br>Environmental Advocacy | Suite 206<br>26 East Exchange Str<br>St. Paul,<br>MN<br>551011667                                     | Electronic Service<br>eet   | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |

| First Name | Last Name | Email                              | Company Name                          | Address  | Delivery Method    | View Trade Secret | Service List Name      |
|------------|-----------|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--|--------------------|-------------------|------------------------|
| Burl W.    | Haar      | burl.haar@state.mn.us              | Public Utilities Commission           | Suite 350<br>121 7th Place East<br>St. Paul,<br>MN<br>551012147    | Electronic Service | Yes               | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Eric       | Jensen    | ejensen@iwla.org                   | Izaak Walton League of<br>America     | Suite 202<br>1619 Dayton Avenue<br>St. Paul,<br>MN<br>55104        | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Nicolle    | Kupser    | nkupser@greatermngas.co<br>m       | Greater Minnesota Gas,<br>Inc.        | 202 South Main Street<br>P.O. Box 68<br>Le Sueur,<br>MN<br>56058   | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Douglas    | Larson    | dlarson@dakotaelectric.co<br>m     | Dakota Electric Association           | 4300 220th St W Farmington, MN 55024                               | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| John       | Lindell   | agorud.ecf@ag.state.mn.us          | Office of the Attorney<br>General-RUD | 1400 BRM Tower<br>445 Minnesota St<br>St. Paul,<br>MN<br>551012130 | Electronic Service | Yes               | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Pam        | Marshall  | pam@energycents.org                | Energy CENTS Coalition                | 823 7th St E  St. Paul,  MN  55106                                 | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Brian      | Meloy     | brian.meloy@stinsonleonar<br>d.com | Stinson,Leonard, Street<br>LLP        | 150 S 5th St Ste 2300  Minneapolis, MN 55402                       | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| David      | Moeller   | dmoeller@allete.com                | Minnesota Power                       | 30 W Superior St  Duluth,  MN  558022093                           | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Andrew     | Moratzka  | apmoratzka@stoel.com               | Stoel Rives LLP                       | 33 South Sixth Street<br>Suite 4200<br>Minneapolis,<br>MN<br>55402 | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Greg       | Palmer    | gpalmer@greatermngas.co<br>m       | Greater Minnesota Gas,<br>Inc.        | PO Box 68<br>202 South Main Street<br>Le Sueur,<br>MN<br>56058     | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |

| First Name | Last Name      | Email                                      | Company Name   | Address   | Delivery Method    | View Trade Secret | Service List Name      |
|------------|----------------|--|--|---|--------------------|-------------------|------------------------|
| Kim        | Pederson       | kpederson@otpco.com                        | Otter Tail Power Company                             | 215 S Cascade St<br>PO Box 496<br>Fergus Falls,<br>MN<br>565380496          | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Kent       | Ragsdale       | kentragsdale@alliantenerg<br>y.com         | Alliant Energy-Interstate<br>Power and Light Company | P.O. Box 351<br>200 First Street, SE<br>Cedar Rapids,<br>IA<br>524060351    | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Richard    | Savelkoul      | rsavelkoul@martinsquires.com               | Martin & Squires, P.A.                               | 332 Minnesota Street Ste<br>W2750<br>St. Paul,<br>MN<br>55101               | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Ron        | Spangler, Jr.  | rlspangler@otpco.com                       | Otter Tail Power Company                             | 215 So. Cascade St.<br>PO Box 496<br>Fergus Falls,<br>MN<br>565380496       | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Erin       | Stojan Ruccolo | ruccolo@fresh-energy.org                   | Fresh Energy   | 408 Saint Peter St Ste 220 Saint Paul, MN 55102-1125                        | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| James M.   | Strommen       | jstrommen@kennedy-<br>graven.com           | Kennedy & Graven,<br>Chartered                       | 470 U.S. Bank Plaza<br>200 South Sixth Stree<br>Minneapolis,<br>MN<br>55402 | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Eric       | Swanson        | eswanson@winthrop.com                      | Winthrop Weinstine                                   | 225 S 6th St Ste 3500<br>Capella Tower<br>Minneapolis,<br>MN<br>554024629   | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| SaGonna    | Thompson       | Regulatory.Records@xcele nergy.com         | Xcel Energy  | 414 Nicollet Mall FL 7  Minneapolis, MN 554011993                           | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Gregory    | Walters        | gjwalters@minnesotaenerg<br>yresources.com | Minnesota Energy<br>Resources Corporation            | 3460 Technology Dr. NW  Rochester, MN 55901                                 | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
| Robyn      | Woeste         | robynwoeste@alliantenerg<br>y.com          | Interstate Power and Light<br>Company                | 200 First St SE  Cedar Rapids, IA 52401                                     | Electronic Service | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |

| First Name | Last Name | Email                   | Company Name                  | Address                   | Delivery Method | View Trade Secret | Service List Name      |
|------------|-----------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|------------------------|
| Kurt       | Yeager    | kyeager@galvinpower.org | Galvin Electricity Initiative | 3412 Hillview Avenue      | Paper Service   | No                | OFF_SL_13-626_Official |
|            |           |                         |                               | Palo Alto,<br>CA<br>94304 |                 |                   |                        |