

Docket No. E002/CI-17-401 Nov 2, 2023, Item 4

Path One	Path Two
Suspend Decision on Baselines/ Targets	Establish Baselines/Set Targets
Xcel Energy	Department
CEE	OAG
CUB	ELPC/Vote Solar
Minneapolis	
Fresh Energy	
R Street	

Decision Options

The main decision before the Commission is whether to move forward with setting baselines and targets for PBR metrics (Step 5 of the PIM process) at this time. The Department provided two paths for the Commission's consideration; they are captured in the decision options below: Path 1 suspends the decision on baselines and targets, and Path 2 establishes baselines and sets targets for some metrics. Additional items for the Commission's consideration are listed first.

Acceptance of Reports

1. Accept the Company's 2021 and 2022 Annual PBR Reports. (Department, CUB, ELPC/Vote Solar, City of Minneapolis, Xcel, [R Street](#), [CEE](#), [Fresh Energy](#))

NEW 1A. [Suspend decisions on Baselines and Targets until the submission of the 2025 PBR Report anticipated on April 30, 2026. Delegate authority to the Executive Secretary to accept the 2023 and 2024 Annual PBR Reports, and to open a comment period following the 2025 PBR Report to solicit comments on whether the Commission should: 1\) establish baselines and targets \(Step 5 of the PIM Process\); or 2\) terminate the PBR process and suspend annual PBR reporting. \(Sieben\)](#)

2. Review and revise metrics every third year, beginning with the Company's 2022 Annual PBR Report filed April 28, 2023. (Staff modification of OAG, Department, [Xcel – alternative](#))

Scorecard

3. Approve the development of an online public scorecard with a stationary image updated annually with the following five performance metrics:
 - a. Average Monthly Bill for Residential Customers
 - b. System Average Interruption Duration Index (SAIDI)
 - c. Residential Customer Service (JD Power overall score)
 - d. Total carbon emissions by
 - i. utility-owned facilities
 - ii. PPAs
 - iii. all sources

e. Demand response, including capacity available (MW & MWh).
(Department, Xcel would support though prefers to wait until a later date when metrics are finalized)

OR

4. Approve the development of an online public scorecard with an image that is updated semi-annually or quarterly, shows data for all current PBR metrics, and includes links to the relevant data. (ELPC/Vote Solar)

Modify Existing Metrics

5. Delegate Authority to the Executive Secretary to solicit stakeholder comments on the future of the avoided CO₂ metrics, including whether it is in the public interest to consider them for targets, and potentially future incentives. (Staff, [Department](#), [Xcel](#), [Minneapolis](#))
6. Modify metrics 1-3, 4a, and 4b under “Cost Effective Alignment of Generation and Load” to include aggregator programs enabled by Xcel. (R Street, [ELPC/VS](#))
7. Remove the demand response performance incentive metric. (Department)
8. Within 60 days of the Commission Order, require Xcel to make a compliance filing identifying which of its existing tariffs and programs qualify under shape, shed, shift, metrics along with current and projected participation over the next 3 years. (Staff, [ELPC/VS](#), [Department](#), [R Street](#), [Fresh Energy](#), [Minneapolis](#))
9. Direct Xcel to work with interested parties to re-evaluate the calculation of the “Load factor for load net of variable renewable generation” and file an update with its 2023 Annual PBR Report, filed in April 2024. (Department Initial with Staff modification; [Fresh Energy](#), [Xcel](#), [Minneapolis](#))
10. Require Xcel to make a compliance filing within 30 days of the order showing the calculations for Load Net of Variable Renewable Generation metric, including the overall system load factor with renewable generation included. (Staff, [Department](#), [Xcel](#), [Fresh Energy](#))
11. Approve the Company’s request to move the Workforce Transition Plan metric to Docket No. E002/M-22-265. (Xcel, Department)
12. Discontinue the requirement that Xcel provide information from the American Consumer Satisfaction Index (ACSI) for the Residential customer satisfaction metric. (Xcel, Department, [R Street](#))

13. Rename the metric currently titled Existing multi-sector metric [which refers to JD Power comprehensive score] to Residential customer satisfaction. (Department with staff addition, [Xcel](#))

Methane

14. Continue to require reporting on the methane emissions-related metrics until such time that the Commission has identified an appropriate natural gas docket for reporting those metrics. (Department, [Fresh Energy](#))
15. Direct Xcel to include in its 2023 Annual PBR Report, filed in April 2024, a discussion of its proposal to move the three methane emissions-related metrics to an appropriate natural gas docket. (Department, [Fresh Energy](#))
16. Move reporting of the methane emission information in the Environmental Performance Outcome Metrics seven through nine - methane emissions from the Company's distribution system, upstream methane emissions, and methane emissions across the full fuel cycle - to Natural Gas Resource Plan dockets. (Xcel with Staff Addition, [Department](#))

New Metrics

Select 17 or 18 or neither

17. Approve the inclusion of a new future metric related to locational reliability and equity. (Department, ELPC/Vote Solar, originally discussed by Xcel, [Minneapolis](#))

OR

18. Require Xcel to propose baseline data and a target for the locational reliability and equity metric in its 2023 Annual PBR Report, filed in April 2024. (Staff alternative, [ELPC/VS](#), [Department](#))
19. Require the Company to file the following information with its 2023 Annual PBR Report, filed in April 2024:
 - a. The number of customers (and the percentage of all residential customers) who were under one or more payment plans during the reporting period
 - b. The percentage of payment plans that ended in a default that then prompted a disconnection
 - c. The average percent reduction in arrears per customer participating in a payment plan during the reporting period.(CUB, Xcel, [Minneapolis](#))

Select 20 or 21 or neither

20. Require the Company to report on fuel cost risk mitigation in its next annual PBR report, filed in April 2024, by providing the percentage of increase in rates and bills that can be attributed to fuel costs. (R Street, [ELPC/VS](#))

OR

21. Delegate authority to the Executive Secretary to include a discussion of fuel cost risk mitigation, as needed, in a comment period in the instant docket after the results of the new Fuel Cost Adjustment (FCA) pilot process in Docket No. E999/CI-03-802 have been analyzed. (OAG, Department, [Minneapolis](#))

PATH 1: Suspend Decision on Baselines and Targets

22. Suspend Decision on Baselines and Targets until after Annual Reports are filed in April 2024. (CEE, Fresh Energy, CUB, City of Minneapolis, Xcel - preferred, [R Street](#), [Fresh Energy](#))

With Path 1, the Department recommends the Commission also do the following; however, Decision Options 23-28 can be done whether path one or path two is selected:

23. Direct the Company to provide an initial assessment of current metrics as they relate to newly passed federal and state policies in its 2023 Annual PBR Report filed in April 2024. (Xcel, [Department](#), [Fresh Energy](#), [Minneapolis](#))
24. Delegate authority to the Executive Secretary to open a process for parties to perform a full metric review and response after the Company files its 2023 Annual PBR Report in 2024. (Xcel, with staff modification, [Department](#))
25. Delegate to the Executive Secretary to include, in a forthcoming comment period, directions to review the existing scope and population of metrics in this proceeding with other state-level PBR proceedings to determine if either the scope or population of metrics should be modified before continuing to the baseline and target setting phase of the process. (Department, with staff modification, [R Street](#), [Minneapolis](#))
26. Delegate to the Executive Secretary to include, in a forthcoming comment period, directions to identify a goal or goals for the PBR process. (Department, with staff modification, [Xcel](#), [R Street](#))
27. Require the Company to include, in its 2023 annual PBR filing made April 2024, a discussion of how a PBR plan would interact with other Commission proceedings such as the Service Reliability and Service Quality (SRSQ) and the Integrated Resource Plan (IRP) processes. (Department, [Xcel](#), [R Street](#), [Fresh Energy](#))
28. Direct Xcel to provide a proposal for the future of the QSP tariff and how the Commission might incorporate the targets for the metrics identified in that tariff in its 2023 Annual PBR Report, filed in April 2024. (Department, [Fresh Energy](#), [Minneapolis](#))

PATH 2: Establish Baselines and Set Targets for Some Metrics

If Path 2 is selected, the Commission should also consider Decision Options 29-72:

BASELINES

Affordability

Select one of 29-31

29. Direct Xcel to provide a methodology for calculating the Rates per KWh metric baseline using Energy Information Administration rates information for all customer classes and in aggregate in its 2023 annual PBR report, filed April 2024. (Department, OAG, [ELPC/VS, R Street](#))

OR

30. Establish baselines for Rates and Bills metrics utilizing the Commission's most recent approved rates in Docket No. E002/GR-21-630. (Xcel)

OR

31. Establish baselines for Rates and Bills metrics by calculating the 3-year static average of 2020-2022 data. (Staff)

Select 32 or 33

32. Establish baselines for arrearages and disconnections using the 3-year static average of 2020-2022 data. (OAG, Staff interpretation of Department Reply Comments Attach. A)

OR

33. Establish baselines for arrearages and disconnections using the static average of 2016-2019 and 2022 data. (Department, Staff interpretation of Department Reply Comments Attachment A, [CUB, Xcel, Minneapolis](#))

Staff note: the Department indicated support for both 32 and 33 with no preference indicated.

Reliability

Select 34 with either 35 or 36 and with either 37 or 38. Or only select 39.

34. Establish the pre-existing baselines using IEEE annual benchmark data as established in the 2022 SRSQ (filed in April of 2023, Docket #23-73) for the following metrics:
 - a. SAIDI
 - b. SAIFI
 - c. CELID
 - d. CEMI

(Department ~~and Xcel~~, with staff inclusion of IEEE for clarification)

Choose 35 or 36 if choosing 34

35. Establish a three-year rolling average baseline for CAIDI. (Xcel)

OR

36. Establish the pre-existing baselines using IEEE annual benchmark data as established in the 2022 SRSQ (filed in April of 2023, Docket #23-73) for CAIDI. (Department)

Choose 37 or 38 if choosing 34

37. Approve the use of converted IEEE SAIDI information to determine the baseline for ASAI. (Department)

OR

38. Establish a three-year rolling average baseline for ASAI. (~~Xcel~~)

Only choose 39 if not selecting from 34 to 38

39. Establish baselines that use Xcel's most recently reported data to calculate 3-year static average of 2020-2022 data for the following six metrics:

- a. SAIDI
- b. SAIFI
- c. CAIDI
- d. CELID
- e. CEMI
- f. ASAI

(OAG, ELPC/VS, Xcel)

Customer Service

Select 40 or 41 and select one option from 42-44

40. Use the pre-existing baselines from the Company's most recently approved Service Quality Tariff for the following three metrics:

- a. Call center response time
- b. Billing invoice accuracy
- c. Number of customer complaints.

(Department, with Staff addition for clarity, Xcel)

OR

41. Establish baselines using 3-year static average of 2020-2022 data for

- a. Call center response time
- b. Billing invoice accuracy
- c. Number of customer complaints

(Staff)

Select 42, 43, or 44

42. Establish the fiftieth (50th) percentile of the J.D. Power annual residential customer survey as the baseline for the Residential customer satisfaction metric. (Department)

OR

43. Establish a three-year rolling average for a Customer Satisfaction baseline. (Xcel)

OR

44. Establish a 3-year static average of 2020-2022 data for a Customer Satisfaction baseline. (Staff)

Environment

Select 45 or 46

45. Direct Xcel to include in its 2023 Annual PBR Report, filed in April 2024:

- a. a discussion of its proposal to establish future carbon dioxide baseline for the Total carbon emissions metric by using the Company's most recent IRP information.
- b. A discussion of its proposal not to develop baselines for the following metrics:
 - i. Carbon intensity (emissions per MWh)
 - ii. Total criteria pollutant emissions
 - iii. Criteria pollutant emission intensity per MWh(~~Department~~, Xcel, Fresh Energy - preferred)

OR

46. Establish baselines for total carbon emissions and carbon intensity (all sources) and total criteria pollutant emissions and intensity (all sources) using a 3-year static average of 2020-2022 data. (Staff interpretation of Department Reply Comments Attachment A, ELPC/VS, Fresh Energy – alternative, Department)

Select 47 or 48

47. Direct Xcel to report data for the CO₂ Emissions Avoided – Transportation metric based on the calendar year. (Staff, Department, Fresh Energy)

OR

48. Direct Xcel to report data for the CO₂ Emissions Avoided – Transportation metric based on the EV Annual Reporting time cycle (May – April). (Xcel)

Select 49 or 50

49. Direct Xcel to use the PUC's electric vehicle registration data for calculating the CO₂ Emissions Avoided – Transportation sub metric. (Staff, Xcel)

OR

50. Direct Xcel to make a compliance filing detailing how it determines the number of electric vehicle registrations within its service territory. (Staff alternative, [Department](#))

Select 51 or 52

51. Establish Xcel's proposed rolling 3-year weighted average methodology for the CO₂ Emissions Avoided – Transportation metric. (Department, Xcel)

OR

52. Establish baselines for the CO₂ Emissions Avoided – Transportation metric using a 3-year static average of 2020-2022 data. (Staff)

Select 53 with any combination of 47 through 52

53. Within 30 days of the Commission's order, require Xcel to make a compliance filing that recalculates the CO₂ Emissions Avoided – Transportation metric and baselines in accordance with the decisions above. (Staff, [Department](#), [Xcel](#), [Fresh Energy](#))

Select 54 or 55

54. Direct Xcel to calculate baselines and targets for CO₂ Emissions Avoided – Buildings, Agriculture, and Other Sectors with its 2023 Annual PBR Report, filed in April 2024. (Staff interpretation of Xcel)

OR

55. Do not establish baselines at this time for CO₂ Emissions Avoided – Buildings, Agriculture, and Other Sectors. (Department, [Xcel](#), [Fresh Energy](#))

Alignment of Generation and Load

Select 56, 57, or 58. 59 can be selected with any of the options.

56. Do not establish a baseline for demand response including capacity available (MW & MWh). (Department)

OR

57. Establish a baseline for available and called demand response using a 3-year static average of 2020-2022 data. (Staff, [ELPC/VS](#), [R Street](#), [Fresh Energy](#), [Minneapolis](#))

OR

58. Establish a three-year rolling baseline for available demand response capacity. (Xcel)

59. Delegate authority to the Executive Secretary to continue development of the record around Cost Effective Alignment of Generation and Load outcome. (Staff, [ELPC/VS](#), [Xcel](#), [R Street](#), [Fresh Energy](#), [Minneapolis](#))

TARGETS

Affordability

60. Adopt a target of five percent below the national average for the:
- Rates per kWh, for residential, industrial, and commercial customers.
 - Average residential monthly bill, adjusted for MN average residential monthly use per customer.
- (Department with staff modification, OAG)
61. Adopt a target to decrease both number of residential disconnections and total dollar amount of arrearages from the baseline value. (OAG, CUB, Department, [Xcel](#), [Minneapolis](#))

Reliability

Select 62 or 63

62. Adopt the pre-existing QSP targets for the following five metrics:
- SAIDI
 - SAIFI
 - CELID
 - CEMI

(~~Department~~, Xcel)

OR

63. Adopt targets for SAIDI, SAIFI, and CAIDI consistent with those set annually in Xcel's SRSQ docket (Staff interpretation of [Department](#))
64. Adopt a target for the Average System Availability Index (ASAI) metric that is consistent with the pre-existing SAIDI SRSQ target. (Department)

Customer Service

Select 65 or 66

65. Adopt the non-reliability-related electric-related metrics with targets included in the Company QSP tariff:
- call center response time
 - billing invoice accuracy
 - number of customer complaints
- (Department, [Xcel](#))

OR

66. Adopt targets for:

- a. call center response time at 90% of calls answered by a representative within 20 seconds and all calls handled via self-service in the Company's Interactive Voice Response System
- b. billing invoice accuracy at 99.8% accurate
- c. number of customer complaints forwarded from the Commission to the Company at less than the $((\text{Number of Customers}/1000) \times 0.1500)$.

(OAG)

Select 67, 68, or take no action

67. Adopt Residential customer satisfaction metric target of Quartile 2 from the J.D. Power annual residential customer survey. (Staff)

OR

68. Adopt Residential customer satisfaction metric target of Quartile 1 from the J.D. Power annual residential customer survey. (Staff)

Environment

69. Adopt mass carbon emission targets on a single year from most recent approved electric IRP. (~~Xcel~~)

70. Direct Xcel to include with 2023 Annual PBR Report, filed in April 2024, predicted emissions for its preferred resource plan. Xcel shall file the data for

- a. Total carbon emissions by utility-owned facilities and PPAs and all sources
- b. Carbon emissions per MWh by utility-owned facilities and PPAs and all sources
- c. Total criteria pollutant emissions
- d. Criteria pollutant emission intensity per MWh

(Staff interpretation of Department recommendation)

Select 71 or 72 or neither

71. Direct Xcel to file a proposal to establish a future target for emissions avoided by building and other sector electrification when the Company files its 2024 Annual PBR Report in April of 2025. (~~Xcel~~)

72. Do not calculate targets at this time for electrification of buildings, agriculture, and other sectors. (Department, Xcel)