



MICHAEL J. AHERN Partner (612) 340-2881 FAX (612) 340-2643 ahern.michael@dorsey.com

April 7, 2014

#### **VIA ELECTRONIC FILING**

Burl W. Haar Executive Secretary Minnesota Public Utilities Commission 121 Seventh Place East, Suite 350 St. Paul, MN 55101

Re: In the Matter of a Commission Inquiry into Decommissioning Policies Related to

Depreciation

Docket No. E,G-999/CI-13-626

Dear Dr. Haar:

Minnesota Energy Resources Corporation (MERC, the Company) submits these Comments in accordance with the Minnesota Public Utilities Commission's (Commission) March 6, 2014 Notice of Comment Period on Decommissioning Cost Investigation in the above referenced docket.

Please feel free to contact me at (612) 340-2881 if you have any questions regarding this matter.

Sincerely yours,

/s/ Michael J. Ahern

Michael J. Ahern

cc: Service List

#### BEFORE THE MINNESOTA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Beverly Jones Heydinger Chair
David C. Boyd Commissioner
Nancy Lange Commissioner
Dan Lipschultz Commissioner
Betsy Wergin Commissioner

In the Matter of a Commission Inquiry into Decommissioning Policies Related to Depreciation Docket No. G-999/CI-13-626

#### **Comments of Minnesota Energy Resources Corporation**

In its March 6, 2014 Notice of Comment Period on Decommissioning Cost Investigation, the Minnesota Public Utilities Commission (Commission) requested that all utility companies provide information on the following topics:

- Provide an explanation of your company's plant decommissioning policies including the relationship of the policy to your company's depreciation expense and the calculation of the salvage portion of the depreciation expense.
- Provide a detailed explanation of how your company's decommissioning probabilities are determined.
- Explain the relationship between the decommissioning probability and the established life for the plant.
- Does your company use decommissioning probability in any other jurisdiction in which you operate?
- Provide any documentation on depreciation practices that provides support for the use of decommissioning probabilities.

Minnesota Energy Resources Company (MERC) provides the following comments in response to the Commission's Notice of Comment Period. MERC's comments reference both decommissioning and cost or removal and it is intended these terms are used interchangeably.

1. Provide an explanation of your company's plant decommissioning policies including the relationship of the policy to your company's depreciation expense and the calculation of the salvage portion of the depreciation expense.

MERC's policy is to accrue for its estimated future removal (decommissioning) costs to its reserve for depreciation through a component of its depreciation expense accruals. This provides for a reserve balance for estimated removal cost to offset its actual cost of removal as it is incurred. MERC's plant assets consist primarily of gas distribution property, sometimes referred to as mass property. For its mass property, MERC relies primarily on the analytical analysis completed during its depreciation study undertakings, along with industry trends and MERC's future expectations. MERC's depreciation studies are usually conducted every five years and provide MERC with updated analytics on its plant asset activity which in turn, can result in changes to each depreciable group's lowa Curve selection, Average Service Life, Remaining Life, and Net Salvage (inclusive of removal costs and salvage) Percent. In combination, these depreciation parameters are used to develop MERC's depreciation expense accruals and the resultant depreciation rate for each of its depreciable asset groups.

In the calculation of MERC's depreciation expense, the depreciation rate determined for each depreciable asset group from the depreciation study is bifurcated into a life (recovery of the plant investment less any salvage) rate and a cost of removal rate. The company's plant accounting software is used to separately calculate and maintain accumulated depreciation reserves for the asset investment as well as its associated cost of removal.

### 2. Provide a detailed explanation of how your company's decommissioning probabilities are determined.

For MERC's mass property assets, historical retirement activity is compared to salvage and removal costs incurred to retire those assets. This comparison is completed by year for each of MERC's depreciable asset groups, e.g. gas mains, gas services, etc. This analysis results in both a salvage and cost of removal percent for ongoing (or interim) retirements. For example, one year of a depreciable group's retirements of \$100,000 with \$5,000 in salvage and \$25,000 in cost of removal would equate to percentages of 5% and 25% respectively. When the two are combined, it results in a negative net salvage percent of 20%. This process is repeated for each year and for each depreciable asset group. When viewed over time, a depreciable asset group's activity could have numerous years of salvage and cost of removal percentages that could indicate trends. MERC's depreciation consultant reviews these results and incorporates their own informed judgment of industry-wide trends and any plans of the company that could impact future expectations, to recommend future removal accrual requirements.

If MERC were to have depreciable asset groups where removal costs for final decommissioning (final removal) is anticipated, MERC would also incorporate these expectations into its analysis for its overall net salvage requirements. Final decommissioning is an additional cost over and above the ongoing removal costs identified above. Final decommissioning is primarily associated with electric generation or gas production facilities. While these facilities have ongoing cost of removal activity, they may also require removal requirements for final closure. MERC's most likely course of action would be to obtain an engineering estimate for decommissioning based on a defined scope to remove the assets. This decommissioning estimate would be prepared using today's dollars. MERC would **not** 

apply "probabilities" that would either "inflate" or "deflate" these costs for time or other expectations.

MERC does not fully understand the context for which this statement was made, however, on its face, MERC disagrees with the position, as summarized in Paragraph III.C. of the Commission's July 31, 2013 Order Approving Remaining Lives, Requiring Cost Adjustments, and Initiating Decommissioning Cost Investigation in this docket:

Briefly, an asset's adjusted plant in service reflects the cost a utility incurred for the asset plus its decommissioning costs – in sum, the cost needed to be recouped to compensate the utility for its known and anticipated investment. Ideally this figure remains constant throughout the asset's service life and serves as a basis for calculating depreciation.

Decommissioning costs – both ongoing and final – do not remain constant. These costs increase or decrease over time. The position ignores this passage of time as well as changes in processes, technology, etc. that may impact the amount of cost of removal required for both ongoing and final removal. MERC would fully expect to be permitted to update its net salvage requirements in its depreciation study filings.

### 3. Explain the relationship between the decommissioning probability and the established life for the plant.

The determination of future decommissioning cost and the establishment of Average Service Lives and Remaining Lives of a depreciable asset group are two separate undertakings. In the end, each are brought together and used to formulate the company's annual depreciation expense accrual and the resulting depreciation rates.

The establishment of a life for each depreciable group is completed by undertaking a depreciation study. Plant activity is analyzed to determine appropriate Iowa Curves and resulting Average Service Lives as well as Remaining Lives. Future depreciation accruals are determined by the cost of the assets plus net salvage less accumulated depreciation reserve. As MERC uses the Remaining Life technique, the future accruals are divided by the depreciable group's remaining life to determine the annual depreciation expense accrual. As stated earlier, depreciation expense accruals, depreciation rates, and accumulated reserves are separately maintained for the asset cost and decommissioning requirements.

# 4. Does your company use decommissioning probability in any other jurisdiction in which you operate?

MERC uses the same process described above for plant assets located in other jurisdictions. MERC is part of Integrys Energy Group, Inc. Integrys' other utility companies accrue for ongoing and final decommissioning costs in Illinois, Michigan, and Wisconsin.

## 5. Provide any documentation on depreciation practices that provides support for the use of decommissioning probabilities.

MERC follows the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC) Code of Federal Regulations, which states in Part 201, Gas Plant Instructions, Paragraph 10.B.2 Additions and

retirements of gas plant that "the cost of removal and the salvage shall be charged or credited, as appropriate, to such depreciation account."

DATED: April 7, 2014 Respectfully Submitted,

DORSEY & WHITNEY LLP

By: /s/ Michael J. Ahern
Michael J. Ahern
50 South Sixth Street, Suite 1500
Minneapolis, MN 55402-1498
Telephone: (612) 340-2600

Attorney for Minnesota Energy Resources Corporation

### **AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE**

STATE OF MINNESOTA	)
	) ss
COUNTY OF HENNEPIN	)

Kristin M. Stastny hereby certifies that on the 7th day of April, 2014, on behalf of Minnesota Energy Resources Corporation (MERC) she electronically filed a true and correct copy of the attached Comments on <a href="www.edockets.state.mn.us">www.edockets.state.mn.us</a>. Said documents were also served via U.S. mail and electronic service as designated on the attached service list.

/s/ Kristin M. Stastny
Kristin M. Stastny

Subscribed and sworn to before me this 7th Day of April, 2014.

/s/ Alice Jaworski
Notary Public, State of Minnesota

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
David	Aafedt	daafedt@winthrop.com	Winthrop & Weinstine, P.A.	Suite 3500, 225 South Sixth Street Minneapolis, MN	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
				554024629			
Michael	Ahern	ahern.michael@dorsey.co m	Dorsey & Whitney, LLP	50 S 6th St Ste 1500  Minneapolis, MN 554021498	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Julia	Anderson	Julia.Anderson@ag.state.m n.us	Office of the Attorney General-DOC	1800 BRM Tower 445 Minnesota St St. Paul, MN 551012134	Electronic Service	Yes	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Peter	Beithon	pbeithon@otpco.com	Otter Tail Power Company	P.O. Box 496 215 South Cascade S Fergus Falls, MN 565380496	Electronic Service treet	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Christina	Brusven	cbrusven@fredlaw.com	Fredrikson & Byron, P.A.	200 S 6th St Ste 4000  Minneapolis, MN 554021425	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Jeffrey A.	Daugherty	jeffrey.daugherty@centerp ointenergy.com	CenterPoint Energy	800 LaSalle Ave  Minneapolis,  MN  55402	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
lan	Dobson	ian.dobson@ag.state.mn.u s	Office of the Attorney General-RUD	Antitrust and Utilities Division 445 Minnesota Street, BRM Tower St. Paul, MN 55101	Electronic Service 1400	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Sharon	Ferguson	sharon.ferguson@state.mn .us	Department of Commerce	85 7th Place E Ste 500  Saint Paul, MN 551012198	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Edward	Garvey	garveyed@aol.com	Residence	32 Lawton St Saint Paul, MN 55102	Paper Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Elizabeth	Goodpaster	bgoodpaster@mncenter.or g	MN Center for Environmental Advocacy	Suite 206 26 East Exchange Str St. Paul, MN 551011667	Electronic Service eet	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Burl W.	Haar	burl.haar@state.mn.us	Public Utilities Commission	Suite 350 121 7th Place East St. Paul, MN 551012147	Electronic Service	Yes	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Eric	Jensen	ejensen@iwla.org	Izaak Walton League of America	Suite 202 1619 Dayton Avenue St. Paul, MN 55104	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Nicolle	Kupser	nkupser@greatermngas.co m	Greater Minnesota Gas, Inc.	202 South Main Street P.O. Box 68 Le Sueur, MN 56058	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Douglas	Larson	dlarson@dakotaelectric.co m	Dakota Electric Association	4300 220th St W Farmington, MN 55024	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
John	Lindell	agorud.ecf@ag.state.mn.us	Office of the Attorney General-RUD	1400 BRM Tower 445 Minnesota St St. Paul, MN 551012130	Electronic Service	Yes	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Pam	Marshall	pam@energycents.org	Energy CENTS Coalition	823 7th St E  St. Paul,  MN  55106	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Brian	Meloy	brian.meloy@stinsonleonar d.com	Stinson,Leonard, Street LLP	150 S 5th St Ste 2300 Minneapolis, MN 55402	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
David	Moeller	dmoeller@allete.com	Minnesota Power	30 W Superior St  Duluth, MN 558022093	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Andrew	Moratzka	apmoratzka@stoel.com	Stoel Rives LLP	33 South Sixth Street Suite 4200 Minneapolis, MN 55402	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Greg	Palmer	gpalmer@greatermngas.co m	Greater Minnesota Gas, Inc.	PO Box 68 202 South Main Street Le Sueur, MN 56058	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Kim	Pederson	kpederson@otpco.com	Otter Tail Power Company	215 S Cascade St PO Box 496 Fergus Falls, MN 565380496	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Kent	Ragsdale	kentragsdale@alliantenerg y.com	Alliant Energy-Interstate Power and Light Company	P.O. Box 351 200 First Street, SE Cedar Rapids, IA 524060351	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Richard	Savelkoul	rsavelkoul@martinsquires.com	Martin & Squires, P.A.	332 Minnesota Street Ste W2750 St. Paul, MN 55101	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Ron	Spangler, Jr.	rlspangler@otpco.com	Otter Tail Power Company	215 So. Cascade St. PO Box 496 Fergus Falls, MN 565380496	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Erin	Stojan Ruccolo	ruccolo@fresh-energy.org	Fresh Energy	408 Saint Peter St Ste 220 Saint Paul, MN 55102-1125	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
James M.	Strommen	jstrommen@kennedy- graven.com	Kennedy & Graven, Chartered	470 U.S. Bank Plaza 200 South Sixth Stree Minneapolis, MN 55402	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Eric	Swanson	eswanson@winthrop.com	Winthrop Weinstine	225 S 6th St Ste 3500 Capella Tower Minneapolis, MN 554024629	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
SaGonna	Thompson	Regulatory.Records@xcele nergy.com	Xcel Energy	414 Nicollet Mall FL 7  Minneapolis, MN 554011993	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Gregory	Walters	gjwalters@minnesotaenerg yresources.com	Minnesota Energy Resources Corporation	3460 Technology Dr. NW  Rochester, MN 55901	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
Robyn	Woeste	robynwoeste@alliantenerg y.com	Interstate Power and Light Company	200 First St SE  Cedar Rapids, IA 52401	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Kurt	Yeager	kyeager@galvinpower.org	Galvin Electricity Initiative	3412 Hillview Avenue	Paper Service	No	OFF_SL_13-626_Official
				Palo Alto, CA 94304			