## **CONTENTS**

- Figure ES-1. VOS Calculation Table: economic value, load match, loss savings and distributed PV value System Wide & Each Planning Area
- Figure ES-2. VOS Rate Table: Calculation of the inflation-adjusted VOS System Wide & Each Planning Area
- Table 3. Fixed assumptions used in the methodology
- Table 4. Environmental costs by year
- Table 5. VOS Data table --required format showing example parameters used in the example calculation.
- Table 6. Azimuth and tilt angle
- Table 7. Losses to be considered
- Table 8. Economic value of avoided fuel costs
- Table 9. Economic value of avoided plant O&M fixed
- Table 10. Economic value of avoided plant O&M variable
- Table 11. Economic value of avoided generation capacity cost.
- Table 12. Economic value of avoided reserve capacity cost.
- Table 13. Economic value of avoided transmission capacity cost.
- Table 13. Economic value of avoided transmission capacity cost.
- Table 14. Determination of deferrable costs.
- Table 15. Economic value of avoided distribution capacity cost. (two pages) System Wide & Each Planning Area
- Table 17. Economic value of avoided environmental costs
- Table 18. Calculation of the inflation-adjusted VOS

Note: Table 1, 2 and 16 were not included as they are not required for the VOS calculation. Table 7 (Losses to be considered) are included in Fig. ES-1

Figure ES-1. VOS Calculation Table: economic value, load match, loss savings and distributed PV value

CURRENT POSITION	Economic Value	Load Match (No Losses)	Distributed Loss Savings	Distributed PV Value
25 Year Levelized Values	(\$/kWh)	(%)	(%)	(\$/kWh)
Avoided Fuel Cost	\$0.0274		9.8%	\$0.0301
Avoided Plant O&M - Fixed	\$0.0027	48.6%	10.8%	\$0.0014
Avoided Plant O&M - Variable	\$0.0012		9.8%	\$0.0014
Avoided Generation Capacity Cost	\$0.0367	48.6%	10.8%	\$0.0197
Avoided Reserve Capacity Cost	\$0.0029	48.6%	10.8%	\$0.0016
Avoided Transmission Capacity Cos	\$0.0325	48.6%	10.8%	\$0.0175
Avoided Distribution Capacity Cost	\$0.0047	54.6%	12.4%	\$0.0029
Avoided Environmental Cost	\$0.0359		9.8%	\$0.0394
Avoided Voltage Control Cost				
Solar Integration Cost				
TOTAL				\$0.1140

Figure ES-2. 1st-Year VOS Rate calculation

Year	Discount Factor	Escalation Factor	VOS Levelized	Disc.	VOS Inflation Adj. (\$/kWh)	Disc
2020	1.000	1.000	\$0.114	\$0.114	\$0.0930	0.093
2021	0.940	1.022	\$0.114	\$0.107	\$0.0951	0.089
2022	0.884	1.045	\$0.114	\$0.101	\$0.0972	0.086
2023	0.831	1.068	\$0.114	\$0.095	\$0.0994	0.083
2024	0.781	1.092	\$0.114	\$0.089	\$0.1016	0.079
2025	0.735	1.117	\$0.114	\$0.084	\$0.1039	0.076
2026	0.691	1.141	\$0.114	\$0.079	\$0.1062	0.073
2027	0.649	1.167	\$0.114	\$0.074	\$0.1086	0.071
2028	0.611	1.193	\$0.114	\$0.070	\$0.1110	0.068
2029	0.574	1.220	\$0.114	\$0.065	\$0.1135	0.065
2030	0.540	1.247	\$0.114	\$0.062	\$0.1160	0.063
2031	0.508	1.275	\$0.114	\$0.058	\$0.1186	0.060
2032	0.477	1.303	\$0.114	\$0.054	\$0.1212	0.058
2033	0.449	1.332	\$0.114	\$0.051	\$0.1239	0.056
2034	0.422	1.362	\$0.114	\$0.048	\$0.1267	0.053
2035	0.397	1.392	\$0.114	\$0.045	\$0.1295	0.051
2036	0.397	1.423	\$0.114	\$0.045	\$0.1324	0.053
2037	0.351	1.455	\$0.114	\$0.040	\$0.1354	0.047
2038	0.330	1.487	\$0.114	\$0.038	\$0.1384	0.046
2039	0.310	1.521	\$0.114	\$0.035	\$0.1415	0.044
2040	0.291	1.554	\$0.114	\$0.033	\$0.1446	0.042
2041	0.274	1.589	\$0.114	\$0.031	\$0.1478	0.041
2042	0.258	1.625	\$0.114	\$0.029	\$0.1511	0.039
2043	0.242	1.661	\$0.114	\$0.028	\$0.1545	0.037
2044	0.228	1.698	\$0.114	\$0.026	\$0.1580	0.036

\$1.501 \$1.509

Table 3. Fixed Assumptions to be used for the VOS calculations

Fuel Prices				
Guaranteed NG Fuel Prices			English and and all English and all the a	
	***	# / 5	Environmental Externalities	7.000
2020	\$2.671	\$/mmBtu	Environmental Discount Rate	5.30% per year
2021	\$2.639	\$/mmBtu	Environmental Costs	separate table
2022	\$2.645	\$/mmBtu		
2023	\$2.720	\$/mmBtu	<b>Economic Assumptions</b>	
2024	\$2.823	\$/mmBtu	General Escalation Rate	2.23% per year
2025	\$2.935	\$/mmBtu		
2026	\$3.047	\$/mmBtu	Treasury Yields	
2027	\$3.159	\$/mmBtu	1 Year	2.17%
2028	\$3.271	\$/mmBtu	2 Year	2.05%
2029	\$3.380	\$/mmBtu	3 Year	2.01%
2030	\$3.490	\$/mmBtu	5 Year	2.04%
2031	\$3.596	\$/mmBtu	7 Year	2.14%
			10 Year	2.25%
Fuel Price Escalation	2.23%		20 Year	2.49%
	<u> </u>		30 Year	2.68%
PV Assumptions				<u> </u>
PV Degradation Rate	0.50%			
PV Life	25			

MPUC IR No. 2
Attachment C - Table 4. Environment Costs

Table 4. Environmental costs by year.

	Analysis							
Year	Year	CO2 Cost	PM 2.5 Cost	CO Cost	NOx Cost	Pb Cost	SO2 Cost	Total Cost
		\$/mmBtu	\$/mmBtu	\$/mmBtu	\$/mmBtu	\$/mmBtu	\$/mmBtu	\$/mmBtu
2020	0	\$2.807	\$0.021	\$0.000	\$0.286	\$0.000	\$0.004	\$3.117
2021	1	\$2.924	\$0.021	\$0.000	\$0.292	\$0.000	\$0.004	\$3.241
2022	2	\$3.045	\$0.021	\$0.000	\$0.299	\$0.000	\$0.004	\$3.369
2023	3	\$3.170	\$0.022	\$0.000	\$0.305	\$0.000	\$0.004	\$3.502
2024	4	\$3.299	\$0.022	\$0.000	\$0.312	\$0.000	\$0.004	\$3.638
2025	5	\$3.433	\$0.023	\$0.000	\$0.319	\$0.000	\$0.004	\$3.779
2026	6	\$3.570	\$0.023	\$0.000	\$0.326	\$0.000	\$0.004	\$3.924
2027	7	\$3.712	\$0.024	\$0.000	\$0.334	\$0.000	\$0.004	\$4.074
2028	8	\$3.859	\$0.025	\$0.000	\$0.341	\$0.000	\$0.004	\$4.229
2029	9	\$4.010	\$0.025	\$0.000	\$0.349	\$0.000	\$0.004	\$4.388
2030	10	\$4.166	\$0.026	\$0.000	\$0.356	\$0.000	\$0.004	\$4.553
2031	11	\$4.344	\$0.026	\$0.000	\$0.364	\$0.000	\$0.004	\$4.740
2032	12	\$4.528	\$0.027	\$0.000	\$0.373	\$0.000	\$0.005	\$4.932
2033	13	\$4.718	\$0.027	\$0.000	\$0.381	\$0.000	\$0.005	\$5.131
2034	14	\$4.915	\$0.028	\$0.000	\$0.389	\$0.000	\$0.005	\$5.337
2035	15	\$5.117	\$0.029	\$0.000	\$0.398	\$0.000	\$0.005	\$5.549
2036	16	\$5.326	\$0.029	\$0.000	\$0.407	\$0.000	\$0.005	\$5.768
2037	17	\$5.542	\$0.030	\$0.000	\$0.416	\$0.000	\$0.005	\$5.993
2038	18	\$5.765	\$0.031	\$0.000	\$0.425	\$0.000	\$0.005	\$6.227
2039	19	\$5.996	\$0.031	\$0.000	\$0.435	\$0.000	\$0.005	\$6.467
2040	20	\$6.233	\$0.032	\$0.000	\$0.444	\$0.000	\$0.005	\$6.715
2041	21	\$6.457	\$0.033	\$0.000	\$0.454	\$0.000	\$0.006	\$6.950
2042	22	\$6.688	\$0.033	\$0.000	\$0.464	\$0.000	\$0.006	\$7.192
2043	23	\$6.926	\$0.034	\$0.000	\$0.475	\$0.000	\$0.006	\$7.441
2044	24	\$7.171	\$0.035	\$0.000	\$0.485	\$0.000	\$0.006	\$7.698

Attachment C - Table 5. VOS Data Table

Table 5. VOS Data table -- required format showing assumptions used in the VOS calculation.

	Input Data	Units		Input Data	Units
Economic Factors		_	Power Generation - Continued		
Start Year for VOS applicability	2020	Year	Other		_
Discount Rate (After-tax WACC)	6.36%	Percentage	Solar weighted Heat Rate	7,742	BTU per kWh
	•	•	Fuel Price Overhead	\$0.004	\$ per MMBtu
Load Match Analysis			Generation life	40	years
ELCC (no loss)	48.6%	% of rating	Heat Rate degradation	0.10%	pear year
PLR (no loss)	54.6%	% of rating	O&M cost (first year) - Fixed	\$3.42	per kW-yr
Loss Savings - Energy	9.8%	% of PV output	O&M cost (first year) - Variable	\$0.0010	\$ per kWh
Loss Savings - PLR	12.4%	% of PV output	O&M cost escalation rate	2.00%	per year
Loss Savings - ELCC	10.8%	% of PV output	Reserve planning margin	7.9%	
		•	Years until new Generation is needed	0	
PV Energy			Distribution		
Simulated - First year annual energy	1,452	kWh per kW-AC	Capacity-related distribution capital costs -System	\$96	\$ per kW
year annual energy		kWh per kW-AC	Capacity-related distribution capital costs - Mpls	N/A	\$ per kW
Actual- First year annual energy	1,563		Capacity-related distribution capital costs - Mtka	N/A	\$ per kW
, ,		•	Capacity-related distribution capital costs -Edina	N/A	\$ per kW
Transmission			Capacity-related distribution capital costs - SE	N/A	\$ per kW
Capacity-related transmission capital cost	\$50.33	\$ per kW	Capacity-related distribution capital costs -MG	N/A	\$ per kW
		•	Capacity-related distribution capital costs - Newport	N/A	\$ per kW
Power Generation			Capacity-related distribution capital costs - St. Paul	N/A	\$ per kW
Peaking CT, simple cycle			Capacity-related distribution capital costs - NW	N/A	\$ per kW
Installed Cost	\$476	\$/kW	Capacity-related distribution capital costs - WBL	N/A	\$ per kW
Heat Rate	9,738	BTU/kWh			
Intermediate CCGT		-	Distribution capital cost escalation	2.00%	per year
Installed Cost	\$1,022	\$/kW	Peak Load (Weather Normalized)	6,420	MW
Heat Rate	6,547	BTU/kWh	Peak Load Growth	0.43%	per year

Attachment C - Table 6. Azimuth and Tilt

Table 6. Azimuth and Tilt Angles

_	Array KW	% of Total	Azimuth	Tilt
1	3 <b>,</b> 209	4.9%	52	25
2	2 <b>,</b> 974	4.5%	140	21
3	2 <b>,</b> 906	4.4%	167	19
4	18 <b>,</b> 979	28.9%	180	12
5	3 <b>,</b> 939	6.0%	180	21
6	7 <b>,</b> 997	12.2%	180	26
7	6 <b>,</b> 676	10.2%	180	30
8	3 <b>,</b> 296	5.0%	180	35
9	947	1.4%	180	42
10	5 <b>,</b> 453	8.3%	180	48
11	2 <b>,</b> 769	4.2%	184	19
12	964	1.5%	197	26
13	2,816	4.3%	212	18
14	1,207	1.8%	237	24
15	1 <b>,</b> 577	2.4%	271	22
TOTAL	65,709	100%	176.4	23.2

Weighted Average

Table 8. Economic Value of Avoided Fuel Costs.

				Pri	ces		Co	sts		Disc.	Costs
	Guaranteed	Burner Tip				p.u. PV			Discount		
Year	NG Price	NG Price	Heat Rate	Utility	vos	Production	Utility	VOS	Factor	Utility	VOS
	\$/mmBtu	\$/mmBtu	mmBtu/kWh	\$/kWh	\$/kWh	(kWh)	(\$)	(\$)	(risk free)	(\$)	(\$)
2020	\$2.67	\$2.67	7,742	\$0.021	\$0.0274	1,563	\$32	\$43	1.000	\$32	\$43
2021	\$2.64	\$2.64	7,750	\$0.020	\$0.0274	1,555	\$32	\$43	0.979	\$31	\$42
2022	\$2.64	\$2.65	7,757	\$0.021	\$0.0274	1,547	\$32	\$42	0.960	\$31	\$41
2023	\$2.72	\$2.72	7,765	\$0.021	\$0.0274	1,540	\$33	\$42	0.942	\$31	\$40
2024	\$2.82	\$2.83	7,773	\$0.022	\$0.0274	1,532	\$34	\$42	0.923	\$31	\$39
2025	\$2.93	\$2.94	7,781	\$0.023	\$0.0274	1,524	\$35	\$42	0.904	\$32	\$38
2026	\$3.05	\$3.05	7,789	\$0.024	\$0.0274	1,517	\$36	\$42	0.883	\$32	\$37
2027	\$3.16	\$3.16	7,796	\$0.025	\$0.0274	1,509	\$37	\$41	0.863	\$32	\$36
2028	\$3.27	\$3.28	7,804	\$0.026	\$0.0274	1,502	\$38	\$41	0.842	\$32	\$35
2029	\$3.38	\$3.38	7,812	\$0.026	\$0.0274	1,494	\$40	\$41	0.822	\$32	\$34
2030	\$3.49	\$3.49	7,820	\$0.027	\$0.0274	1,487	\$41	\$41	0.801	\$33	\$33
2031	\$3.60	\$3.60	7,828	\$0.028	\$0.0274	1,479	\$42	\$41	0.781	\$33	\$32
2032	\$3.68	\$3.68	7,835	\$0.029	\$0.0274	1,472	\$42	<b>\$4</b> 0	0.762	\$32	\$31
2033	\$3.76	\$3.76	7,843	\$0.030	\$0.0274	1,464	\$43	\$40	0.742	\$32	\$30
2034	\$3.84	\$3.85	7,851	\$0.030	\$0.0274	1,457	\$44	\$40	0.723	\$32	\$29
2035	\$3.93	\$3.93	7,859	\$0.031	\$0.0274	1,450	\$45	\$40	0.704	\$32	\$28
2036	\$4.01	\$4.02	7,867	\$0.032	\$0.0274	1,443	\$46	\$40	0.685	\$31	\$27
2037	\$4.10	\$4.11	7,875	\$0.032	\$0.0274	1,435	\$46	\$39	0.666	\$31	\$26
2038	\$4.20	\$4.20	7,883	\$0.033	\$0.0274	1,428	\$47	\$39	0.648	\$31	\$25
2039	\$4.29	\$4.30	7,890	\$0.034	\$0.0274	1,421	\$48	\$39	0.629	\$30	\$25
2040	\$4.39	\$4.39	7,898	\$0.035	\$0.0274	1,414	\$49	\$39	0.611	\$30	\$24
2041	\$4.48	\$4.49	7,906	\$0.035	\$0.0274	1,407	\$50	\$39	0.594	\$30	\$23
2042	\$4.58	\$4.59	7,914	\$0.036	\$0.0274	1,400	\$51	\$38	0.577	\$29	\$22
2043	\$4.69	\$4.69	7,922	\$0.037	\$0.0274	1,393	\$52	\$38	0.561	\$29	\$21
2044	\$4.79	\$4.80	7,930	\$0.038	\$0.0274	1,386	\$53	\$38	0.544	\$29	\$21

Validation: Present Value \$779 \$779

Table 9. Economic value of avoided plant O&M - fixed

				Pri	ices		Co	osts		Disc.	Costs
	O&M	Utility	PV			p.u. PV			Discount		
Year	Fixed	Capacity	Capacity	Utility	vos	Production	Utility	vos	Factor	Utility	VOS
	\$/kW	per unit		\$/kWh	\$/kWh	(kWh)	(\$)	(\$)		(\$)	(\$)
2020	\$3.42	1.00	1.00	\$0.0022	\$0.0027	1,563	\$3.42	\$4.14	1.000	\$3.42	\$4.14
2021	\$3.49	0.999	0.995	\$0.0022	\$0.0027	1,555	\$3.48	\$4.12	0.940	\$3.27	\$3.88
2022	\$3.56	0.998	0.990	\$0.0023	\$0.0027	1,547	\$3.53	\$4.10	0.884	\$3.12	\$3.63
2023	\$3.63	0.997	0.985	\$0.0024	\$0.0027	1,540	\$3.59	\$4.08	0.831	\$2.98	\$3.39
2024	\$3.71	0.996	0.980	\$0.0024	\$0.0027	1,532	\$3.65	\$4.06	0.781	\$2.85	\$3.17
2025	\$3.78	0.995	0.975	\$0.0025	\$0.0027	1,524	\$3.71	\$4.04	0.735	\$2.72	\$2.97
2026	\$3.86	0.994	0.970	\$0.0025	\$0.0027	1,517	\$3.76	\$4.02	0.691	\$2.60	\$2.78
2027	\$3.93	0.993	0.966	\$0.0026	\$0.0027	1,509	\$3.82	\$4.00	0.649	\$2.48	\$2.60
2028	\$4.01	0.992	0.961	\$0.0027	\$0.0027	1,502	\$3.89	\$3.98	0.611	\$2.37	\$2.43
2029	\$4.09	0.991	0.956	\$0.0027	\$0.0027	1,494	\$3.95	\$3.96	0.574	\$2.27	\$2.27
2030	\$4.17	0.990	0.951	\$0.0028	\$0.0027	1,487	\$4.01	\$3.94	0.540	\$2.16	\$2.13
2031	\$4.26	0.989	0.946	\$0.0028	\$0.0027	1,479	\$4.07	\$3.92	0.508	\$2.07	\$1.99
2032	\$4.34	0.988	0.942	\$0.0029	\$0.0027	1,472	\$4.14	\$3.90	0.477	\$1.97	\$1.86
2033	\$4.43	0.987	0.937	\$0.0030	\$0.0027	1,464	\$4.20	\$3.88	0.449	\$1.89	\$1.74
2034	\$4.52	0.986	0.932	\$0.0031	\$0.0027	1,457	\$4.27	\$3.86	0.422	\$1.80	\$1.63
2035	\$4.52	0.985	0.928	\$0.0031	\$0.0027	1,450	\$4.25	\$3.84	0.397	\$1.69	\$1.52
2036	\$4.70	0.984	0.923	\$0.0032	\$0.0027	1,443	\$4.41	\$3.82	0.397	\$1.75	\$1.52
2037	\$4.79	0.983	0.918	\$0.0033	\$0.0027	1,435	\$4.48	\$3.80	0.351	\$1.57	\$1.33
2038	\$4.89	0.982	0.914	\$0.0034	\$0.0027	1,428	\$4.55	\$3.78	0.330	\$1.50	\$1.25
2039	\$4.99	0.981	0.909	\$0.0034	\$0.0027	1,421	\$4.62	\$3.77	0.310	\$1.43	\$1.17
2040	\$5.09	0.980	0.905	\$0.0035	\$0.0027	1,414	\$4.70	\$3.75	0.291	\$1.37	\$1.09
2041	\$5.19	0.979	0.900	\$0.0036	\$0.0027	1,407	\$4.77	\$3.73	0.274	\$1.31	\$1.02
2042	\$5.29	0.978	0.896	\$0.0037	\$0.0027	1,400	\$4.85	\$3.71	0.258	\$1.25	\$0.96
2043	\$5.40	0.977	0.891	\$0.0038	\$0.0027	1,393	\$4.92	\$3.69	0.242	\$1.19	\$0.89
2044	\$5.51	0.976	0.887	\$0.0039	\$0.0027	1,386	\$5.00	\$3.67	0.228	\$1.14	\$0.84

Validation: Present Value	\$52	\$52

Table 10. Economic value of avoided plant O&M - variable

	Pri	ces		Co	sts		Disc.	Costs
			p.u. PV			Discount		
Year	Utility	vos	Production	Utility	vos	Factor	Utility	vos
	\$/kWh	\$/kWh	(kWh)	(\$)	(\$)	(risk free)	(\$)	(\$)
2020	\$0.0010	\$0.0012	1,563	\$2	\$2	1.000	\$2	\$2
2021	\$0.0011	\$0.0012	1,555	\$2	\$2	0.940	\$2	\$2
2022	\$0.0011	\$0.0012	1,547	\$2	\$2	0.884	\$1	\$2
2023	\$0.0011	\$0.0012	1,540	\$2	\$2	0.831	\$1	\$2
2024	\$0.0011	\$0.0012	1,532	\$2	\$2	0.781	\$1	\$1
2025	\$0.0011	\$0.0012	1,524	\$2	\$2	0.735	\$1	\$1
2026	\$0.0012	\$0.0012	1,517	\$2	\$2	0.691	\$1	\$1
2027	\$0.0012	\$0.0012	1,509	\$2	\$2	0.649	\$1	\$1
2028	\$0.0012	\$0.0012	1,502	\$2	\$2	0.611	\$1	\$1
2029	\$0.0012	\$0.0012	1,494	\$2	\$2	0.574	\$1	\$1
2030	\$0.0013	\$0.0012	1,487	\$2	\$2	0.540	\$1	\$1
2031	\$0.0013	\$0.0012	1,479	\$2	\$2	0.508	\$1	\$1
2032	\$0.0013	\$0.0012	1,472	\$2	\$2	0.477	\$1	\$1
2033	\$0.0013	\$0.0012	1,464	\$2	\$2	0.449	\$1	\$1
2034	\$0.0014	\$0.0012	1,457	\$2	\$2	0.422	\$1	\$1
2035	\$0.0014	\$0.0012	1,450	\$2	\$2	0.397	\$1	\$1
2036	\$0.0014	\$0.0012	1,443	\$2	\$2	0.373	\$1	\$1
2037	\$0.0014	\$0.0012	1,435	\$2	\$2	0.351	\$1	\$1
2038	\$0.0015	\$0.0012	1,428	\$2	\$2	0.330	\$1	\$1
2039	\$0.0015	\$0.0012	1,421	\$2	\$2	0.310	\$1	\$1
2040	\$0.0015	\$0.0012	1,414	\$2	\$2	0.291	\$1	\$1
2041	\$0.0016	\$0.0012	1,407	\$2	\$2	0.274	\$1	\$0
2042	\$0.0016	\$0.0012	1,400	\$2	\$2	0.258	\$1	\$0
2043	\$0.0016	\$0.0012	1,393	\$2	\$2	0.242	\$1	\$0
2044	\$0.0017	\$0.0012	1,386	\$2	\$2	0.228	\$1	\$0

Validation: Present Value \$24 \$24

Table 11. Economic value of avoided generation capacity cost.

				Pric	es		Co	sts		Disc. Cost	
Year	Capacity Cost	Utility Capacity	PV Capacity	Utility	vos	PV Production	Utility	vos	Discount Factor	Utility	vos
	\$/kW-yr	pu.	kW	\$/kWh	\$/kWh	(kWh)	(\$)	(\$)		(\$)	(\$)
2020	\$57	1.00	1.00	\$0.036	\$0.0367	1,563	\$57	\$57	1.000	\$57	\$57
2021	\$57	0.999	0.995	\$0.036	\$0.0367	1,555	\$57	\$57	0.940	\$53	\$54
2022	\$57	0.998	0.990	\$0.036	\$0.0367	1,547	\$56	\$57	0.884	\$50	\$50
2023	\$57	0.997	0.985	\$0.036	\$0.0367	1,540	\$56	\$56	0.831	\$47	\$47
2024	\$57	0.996	0.980	\$0.036	\$0.0367	1,532	\$56	\$56	0.781	\$44	\$44
2025	\$57	0.995	0.975	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,524	\$56	\$56	0.735	\$41	\$41
2026	\$57	0.994	0.970	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,517	\$55	\$56	0.691	\$38	\$38
2027	\$57	0.993	0.966	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,509	\$55	\$55	0.649	\$36	\$36
2028	\$57	0.992	0.961	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,502	\$55	\$55	0.611	\$34	\$34
2029	\$57	0.991	0.956	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,494	\$55	\$55	0.574	\$31	\$31
2030	\$57	0.990	0.951	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,487	\$55	\$55	0.540	\$29	\$29
2031	\$57	0.989	0.946	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,479	\$54	\$54	0.508	\$28	\$28
2032	\$57	0.988	0.942	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,472	\$54	\$54	0.477	\$26	\$26
2033	\$57	0.987	0.937	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,464	\$54	\$54	0.449	\$24	\$24
2034	\$57	0.986	0.932	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,457	\$54	\$53	0.422	\$23	\$23
2035	\$57	0.985	0.928	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,450	\$53	\$53	0.397	\$21	\$21
2036	\$57	0.984	0.923	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,443	\$53	\$53	0.373	\$20	\$20
2037	\$57	0.983	0.918	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,435	\$53	\$53	0.351	\$19	\$18
2038	\$57	0.982	0.914	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,428	\$53	\$52	0.330	\$17	\$17
2039	\$57	0.981	0.909	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,421	\$53	\$52	0.310	\$16	\$16
2040	\$57	0.980	0.905	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,414	\$52	\$52	0.291	\$15	\$15
2041	\$57	0.979	0.900	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,407	\$52	\$52	0.274	\$14	\$14
2042	\$57	0.978	0.896	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,400	\$52	\$51	0.258	\$13	\$13
2043	\$57	0.977	0.891	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,393	\$52	\$51	0.242	\$13	\$12
2044	\$57	0.976	0.887	\$0.037	\$0.0367	1,386	\$52	\$51	0.228	\$12	\$12

Validation: Present Value	\$721	\$721

Attachment C - Table 12. Avoided Reserve Cap.

Table 12. Economic value of avoided reserve capacity cost.

					Pric	es		Co	sts		Disc.	Costs
Year	Capacity Cost \$/kW-yr	Reserve Margin	Utility Capacity	PV Capacity	Utility \$/kWh	VOS \$/kWh	PV Production (kWh)	Utility (\$)	VOS (\$)	Discount Factor	Utility (\$)	VOS
2020	\$57	7.9%	pu. 1.00	1.00	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,563	\$4	\$5	1.000	\$4	(\$) \$5
2020	\$57 \$57	7.9%	0.999	0.995	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,555	\$4 \$4	\$5 \$5	0.940	\$4 \$4	\$3 \$4
2021	\$57 \$57	7.9%	0.998	0.990	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,547	\$4 \$4	\$3 \$4	0.940	\$4 \$4	\$4 \$4
2022	\$57 \$57	7.9%	0.998	0.985	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,540	\$4 \$4	\$4 \$4	0.831	\$4 \$4	\$4 \$4
2023	\$57 \$57	7.9%	0.997	0.980	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,532	\$4 \$4	\$4 \$4	0.781	\$ <del>4</del> \$3	\$ <del>4</del> \$3
2024	\$57 \$57	7.9%	0.995	0.975	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,524	\$4 \$4	\$ <del>4</del>	0.735	\$3 \$3	\$3 \$3
2026	\$57	7.9%	0.994	0.979	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,517	\$ <del>4</del>	\$4	0.691	\$3	\$3
2027	\$57 \$57	7.9%	0.993	0.966	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,509	\$ <del>4</del>	\$4	0.649	\$3	\$3 \$3
2028	\$57	7.9%	0.992	0.961	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,502	\$4	\$4	0.611	\$3	\$3
2029	\$57	7.9%	0.991	0.956	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,494	\$4	\$4	0.574	\$2	\$3 \$2
2030	\$57	7.9%	0.990	0.951	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,487	\$4	\$4	0.540	\$2	\$2
2031	\$57	7.9%	0.989	0.946	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,479	\$4	\$4	0.508	\$2	\$2
2032	\$57	7.9%	0.988	0.942	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,472	\$4	\$4	0.477	\$2	\$2
2033	\$57	7.9%	0.987	0.937	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,464	\$4	\$4	0.449	\$2	\$2 \$2
2034	\$57	7.9%	0.986	0.932	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,457	\$4	\$4	0.422	\$2	\$2
2035	\$57	7.9%	0.985	0.928	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,450	\$4	\$4	0.397	\$2	\$2
2036	<b>\$</b> 57	7.9%	0.984	0.923	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,443	\$4	\$4	0.373	\$2	\$2
2037	\$57	7.9%	0.983	0.918	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,435	\$4	* · \$4	0.351	*- \$1	\$1
2038	<b>\$</b> 57	7.9%	0.982	0.914	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,428	\$4	\$4	0.330	\$1	\$1
2039	<b>\$</b> 57	7.9%	0.981	0.909	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,421	\$4	\$4	0.310	\$1	\$1
2040	\$57	7.9%	0.980	0.905	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,414	\$4	\$4	0.291	\$1	\$1
2041	<b>\$</b> 57	7.9%	0.979	0.900	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,407	\$4	\$4	0.274	\$1	<b>\$</b> 1
2042	\$57	7.9%	0.978	0.896	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,400	\$4	\$4	0.258	\$1	<b>\$</b> 1
2043	\$57	7.9%	0.977	0.891	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,393	\$4	\$4	0.242	<b>\$</b> 1	*1
2044	\$57	7.9%	0.976	0.887	\$0.003	\$0.0029	1,386	\$4	\$4	0.228	*1	*1
						\$0.0020	,		"		"	

Validation: Present Value	\$57	\$57

Attachment C - Table 13. Avoided Trans. Cap.

Table 13. Economic value of avoided transmission capacity cost.

				Prices			Costs			Disc.	Costs
Year	Capacity Cost	Utility Capacity	PV Capacity	Utility	vos	PV Production	Utility	vos	Discount Factor	Utility	vos
	\$/kW-yr	pu.	kW	\$/kWh	\$/kWh	(kWh)	(\$)	(\$)		(\$)	(\$)
2020	\$50	1.00	1.00	\$0.032	\$0.0325	1,563	\$50	\$51	1.000	\$50	\$51
2021	\$50	0.999	0.995	\$0.032	\$0.0325	1,555	\$50	\$51	0.940	\$47	\$47
2022	\$50	0.998	0.990	\$0.032	\$0.0325	1,547	\$50	\$50	0.884	\$44	\$44
2023	\$50	0.997	0.985	\$0.032	\$0.0325	1,540	\$50	\$50	0.831	\$41	\$42
2024	\$50	0.996	0.980	\$0.032	\$0.0325	1,532	\$50	\$50	0.781	\$39	\$39
2025	\$50	0.995	0.975	\$0.032	\$0.0325	1,524	<b>\$4</b> 9	\$50	0.735	\$36	\$36
2026	\$50	0.994	0.970	\$0.032	\$0.0325	1,517	<b>\$4</b> 9	<b>\$</b> 49	0.691	\$34	\$34
2027	\$50	0.993	0.966	\$0.032	\$0.0325	1,509	\$49	\$49	0.649	\$32	\$32
2028	\$50	0.992	0.961	\$0.032	\$0.0325	1,502	\$49	\$49	0.611	\$30	\$30
2029	\$50	0.991	0.956	\$0.032	\$0.0325	1,494	\$49	\$49	0.574	\$28	\$28
2030	\$50	0.990	0.951	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,487	\$48	\$48	0.540	\$26	\$26
2031	\$50	0.989	0.946	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,479	\$48	\$48	0.508	\$24	\$24
2032	\$50	0.988	0.942	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,472	\$48	\$48	0.477	\$23	\$23
2033	\$50	0.987	0.937	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,464	\$48	\$48	0.449	\$21	\$21
2034	\$50	0.986	0.932	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,457	\$48	\$47	0.422	\$20	\$20
2035	\$50	0.985	0.928	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,450	\$47	\$47	0.397	<b>\$</b> 19	\$19
2036	\$50	0.984	0.923	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,443	\$47	\$47	0.373	\$18	\$17
2037	\$50	0.983	0.918	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,435	\$47	\$47	0.351	\$16	\$16
2038	\$50	0.982	0.914	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,428	\$47	\$46	0.330	\$15	\$15
2039	\$50	0.981	0.909	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,421	\$47	\$46	0.310	\$14	\$14
2040	\$50	0.980	0.905	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,414	\$46	\$46	0.291	\$14	\$13
2041	\$50	0.979	0.900	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,407	\$46	\$46	0.274	\$13	\$13
2042	\$50	0.978	0.896	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,400	\$46	\$45	0.258	\$12	\$12
2043	\$50	0.977	0.891	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,393	\$46	\$45	0.242	\$11	\$11
2044	\$50	0.976	0.887	\$0.033	\$0.0325	1,386	\$46	\$45	0.228	\$10	<b>\$</b> 10

Validation: Present Value \$6.39 \$6.39	Validation: Present Value \$639 \$639
---	---------------------------------------

Attachment C - Table 14 Dist. Deferrable Cost

Table 14. Determination of deferrable distribution costs.

	Distribution	% Capacity	Capacity	
Year	Project Costs	Related	Related	
	\$	%	\$	
2018	175,490,525	4.5%	7,812,185	
2017	155,018,178	6.6%	10,270,204	
2016	165,929,956	9.6%	15,936,132	
2015	134,867,264	12.1%	16,309,114	
2014	129,899,465	16.3%	21,147,768	
2013	142,118,822	20.3%	28,825,462	
2012	109,286,058	20.8%	22,683,879	
2011	100,102,075	7.5%	7,502,291	
2010	98,267,667	11.0%	10,823,959	
2009	82,821,606	10.6%	8,749,417	
TOTAL 10-YEAR PERIOD	1,293,801,616		150,060,411	

Table 15. Economic value of avoided distribution capacity cost.

Conventional Distribution Planning Deferred Distribution Planning

		Co	nventional Di	istribution Plant	ung	Deterred Distribution Planning				
Year	Distribution Cost	New Dist. Capacity	Capital Cost	Disc Capital Cost	Amortized	Def. Dist. Capacity	Def. Capital Cost	Disc Capital Cost	Amortized	
	\$/kW-yr	(MW)	(\$M)	(\$M)	\$M/yr	(MW)	(\$M)	(\$M)	\$M/vr	
2020	\$134	50	\$7	\$7	\$9	,		```	\$9	
2021	\$137	50	\$7	\$6	\$9	50	\$6.8	\$6.4	\$9	
2022	\$139	50	\$7	\$6	\$9	50	\$7.0	\$6.2	\$9	
2023	\$142	51	\$7	\$6	\$9	50	\$7.2	\$6.0	\$9	
2024	\$145	51	\$7	\$6	\$9	51	\$7.3	\$5.7	\$9	
2025	\$148	51	\$8	\$6	\$9	51	\$7.5	\$5.5	\$9	
2026	\$151	51	\$8	\$5	\$9	51	\$7.7	\$5.3	\$9	
2027	\$154	52	\$8	\$5	\$9	51	\$7.9	\$5.1	\$9	
2028	\$157	52	\$8	\$5	\$9	52	\$8.1	\$4.9	\$9	
2029	\$160	52	\$8	\$5	\$9	52	\$8.3	\$4.8	\$9	
2030	\$163	52	\$9	\$5	\$9	52	\$8.5	\$4.6	\$9	
2031	\$167	52	\$9	\$4	\$9	52	\$8.7	\$4.4	\$9	
2032	\$170	53	\$9	\$4	\$9	52	\$8.9	\$4.2	\$9	
2033	\$173	53	\$9	\$4	\$9	53	\$9.1	\$4.1	\$9	
2034	\$177	53	\$9	\$4	\$9	53	\$9.3	\$3.9	\$9	
2035	\$180	53	\$10	\$4	\$9	53	\$9.6	\$3.8	\$9	
2036	\$184	54	\$10	\$4	\$9	53	\$9.8	\$3.7	\$9	
2037	\$188	54	\$10	\$4	\$9	54	\$10.0	\$3.5	\$9	
2038	\$191	54	\$10	\$3	\$9	54	\$10.3	\$3.4	\$9	
2039	\$195	54	\$11	\$3	\$9	54	\$10.5	\$3.3	\$9	
2040	\$199	54	\$11	\$3	\$9	54	\$10.8	\$3.1	\$9	
2041	\$203	55	\$11	\$3	\$9	54	\$11.1	\$3.0	\$9	
2042	\$207	55	\$11	\$3	\$9	55	\$11.3	\$2.9	\$9	
2043	\$211	55	\$12	\$3	\$9	55	\$11.6	\$2.8	\$9	
2044	\$216	55	\$12	\$3	\$9	55	\$11.9	\$2.7	\$9	
2039	\$220					55	\$12.2	\$2.6		
			-	\$111		-		\$106	-	

Continued - Table 15. Economic value of avoided distribution capacity cost. EXAMPLE

Prices			Co	sts		Disc.	Costs
Utility \$/kWh	VOS \$/kWh	PV Production (kWh)	Utility (\$)	vos (\$)	Discount Factor	Utility (\$)	VOS (\$)
\$0.00470	\$0,0047	1,563	(\$) \$7	\$7	1,000	(\$) \$7	(\$) \$7
\$0.00470	\$0.0047		\$7 \$7	\$7 \$7	0.940	\$7 \$7	\$7 \$7
	******	1,555					
\$0.00470	\$0.0047	1,547	\$7	<b>\$</b> 7	0.884	\$6	\$6
\$0.00471	\$0.0047	1,540	\$7	\$7	0.831	\$6	\$6
\$0.00471	\$0.0047	1,532	\$7	<b>\$</b> 7	0.781	\$6	\$6
\$0.00471	\$0.0047	1,524	\$7	<b>\$</b> 7	0.735	\$5	\$5
\$0.00472	\$0.0047	1,517	\$7	<b>\$</b> 7	0.691	\$5	\$5
\$0.00472	\$0.0047	1,509	\$7	\$7	0.649	\$5	\$5
\$0.00472	\$0.0047	1,502	\$7	\$7	0.611	\$4	\$4
\$0.00473	\$0.0047	1,494	\$7	<b>\$</b> 7	0.574	\$4	\$4
\$0.00473	\$0.0047	1,487	<b>\$</b> 7	<b>\$</b> 7	0.540	\$4	\$4
\$0.00474	\$0.0047	1,479	<b>\$</b> 7	<b>\$</b> 7	0.508	\$4	\$4
\$0.00474	\$0.0047	1,472	\$7	\$7	0.477	\$3	\$3
\$0.00474	\$0.0047	1,464	\$7	<b>\$</b> 7	0.449	\$3	\$3
\$0.00475	\$0.0047	1,457	\$7	\$7	0.422	\$3	\$3
\$0.00475	\$0.0047	1,450	\$7	\$7	0.397	\$3	\$3
\$0.00475	\$0.0047	1,443	\$7	\$7	0.373	\$3	\$3
\$0.00476	\$0.0047	1,435	\$7	\$7	0.351	\$2	\$2
\$0.00476	\$0.0047	1,428	\$7	\$7	0.330	\$2	\$2
\$0.00476	\$0.0047	1,421	\$7	\$7	0.310	\$2	\$2
\$0.00477	\$0.0047	1,414	\$7	\$7	0.291	\$2	\$2
\$0.00477	\$0.0047	1,407	\$7	\$7	0.274	\$2	\$2
\$0.00477	\$0.0047	1,400	\$7	\$7	0.258	\$2	\$2
\$0.00478	\$0.0047	1,393	\$7	\$7	0.242	\$2	\$2
\$0.00478	\$0.0047	1,386	\$7	\$7	0.228	\$2	\$1
	\$0,0047		v	alidation:	Present Value	\$93	S

Table 17. Economic value of avoided environmental costs

Environmental Discount Rate

5.30%

			Prices			Co	sts		Disc. Costs	
Year	Env. Cost	Solar Weighted Heat Rate	Utility	vos	p.u. PV Production	Utility	vos	Discount Factor	Utility	vos
	\$/mmBtu	mmBtu/MWh	\$/kWh	\$/kWh	(kWh)	(\$)	(\$)	(risk free)	(\$)	(\$)
2020	\$3.12	7,742	\$0.024	\$0.0359	1,563	\$38	\$56	1.000	\$38	\$56
2021	\$3.24	7,750	\$0.025	\$0.0359	1,555	\$39	\$56	0.950	\$37	\$53
2022	\$3.37	7,757	\$0.026	\$0.0359	1,547	\$40	\$56	0.902	\$36	\$50
2023	\$3.50	7,765	\$0.027	\$0.0359	1,540	\$42	\$55	0.857	\$36	\$47
2024	\$3.64	7,773	\$0.028	\$0.0359	1,532	\$43	\$55	0.813	\$35	\$45
2025	\$3.78	7,781	\$0.029	\$0.0359	1,524	\$45	\$55	0.773	\$35	\$42
2026	\$3.92	7,789	\$0.031	\$0.0359	1,517	\$46	\$54	0.734	\$34	\$40
2027	\$4.07	7,796	\$0.032	\$0.0359	1,509	\$48	\$54	0.697	\$33	\$38
2028	\$4.23	7,804	\$0.033	\$0.0359	1,502	\$50	\$54	0.662	\$33	\$36
2029	\$4.39	7,812	\$0.034	\$0.0359	1,494	\$51	\$54	0.628	\$32	\$34
2030	\$4.55	7,820	\$0.036	\$0.0359	1,487	\$53	\$53	0.597	\$32	\$32
2031	\$4.74	7,828	\$0.037	\$0.0359	1,479	\$55	\$53	0.567	\$31	\$30
2032	\$4.93	7,835	\$0.039	\$0.0359	1,472	\$57	\$53	0.538	\$31	\$28
2033	\$5.13	7,843	\$0.040	\$0.0359	1,464	\$59	\$53	0.511	\$30	\$27
2034	\$5.34	7,851	\$0.042	\$0.0359	1,457	\$61	\$52	0.485	\$30	\$25
2035	\$5.55	7,859	\$0.044	\$0.0359	1,450	\$63	\$52	0.461	\$29	\$24
2036	\$5.77	7,867	\$0.045	\$0.0359	1,443	\$65	\$52	0.438	\$29	\$23
2037	\$5.99	7,875	\$0.047	\$0.0359	1,435	\$68	\$51	0.416	\$28	\$21
2038	\$6.23	7,883	\$0.049	\$0.0359	1,428	<b>\$</b> 70	\$51	0.395	\$28	\$20
2039	\$6.47	7,890	\$0.051	\$0.0359	1,421	\$73	\$51	0.375	\$27	\$19
2040	\$6.72	7,898	\$0.053	\$0.0359	1,414	\$75	\$51	0.356	\$27	\$18
2041	\$6.95	7,906	\$0.055	\$0.0359	1,407	\$77	\$50	0.338	\$26	\$17
2042	\$7.19	7,914	\$0.057	\$0.0359	1,400	\$80	\$50	0.321	\$26	\$16
2043	\$7.44	7,922	\$0.059	\$0.0359	1,393	\$82	\$50	0.305	\$25	\$15
2044	\$7.70	7,930	\$0.061	\$0.0359	1,386	\$85	\$50	0.290	\$25	\$14

Validation: Present Value \$771 \$771

Table 18. Calculation of inflation-adjusted VOS

						VOS	
	Discount	PV	Escallation	VOS		Inflation Adj.	
Year	Factor	Production	Factor	Levelized	Disc.	(\$/kWh)	Disc
2020	1.000	1563	1.000	\$0.114	\$178	\$0.0930	145.422
2021	0.940	1555	1.022	\$0.114	\$167	\$0.0951	139.076
2022	0.884	1547	1.045	\$0.114	\$156	\$0.0972	133.008
2023	0.831	1540	1.068	\$0.114	\$146	\$0.0994	127.204
2024	0.781	1532	1.092	\$0.114	\$136	\$0.1016	121.653
2025	0.735	1524	1.117	\$0.114	\$128	\$0.1039	116.345
2026	0.691	1517	1.141	\$0.114	\$119	\$0.1062	111.268
2027	0.649	1509	1.167	\$0.114	\$112	\$0.1086	106.412
2028	0.611	1502	1.193	\$0.114	\$105	\$0.1110	101.769
2029	0.574	1494	1.220	\$0.114	\$98	\$0.1135	97.328
2030	0.540	1487	1.247	\$0.114	\$91	\$0.1160	93.081
2031	0.508	1479	1.275	\$0.114	\$86	\$0.1186	89.019
2032	0.477	1472	1.303	\$0.114	\$80	\$0.1212	85.135
2033	0.449	1464	1.332	\$0.114	\$75	\$0.1239	81.420
2034	0.422	1457	1.362	\$0.114	\$70	\$0.1267	77.867
2035	0.397	1450	1.392	\$0.114	\$66	\$0.1295	74.469
2036	0.397	1443	1.423	\$0.114	\$65	\$0.1324	75.749
2037	0.351	1435	1.455	\$0.114	\$57	\$0.1354	68.112
2038	0.330	1428	1.487	\$0.114	\$54	\$0.1384	65.140
2039	0.310	1421	1.521	\$0.114	\$50	\$0.1415	62.297
2040	0.291	1414	1.554	\$0.114	\$47	\$0.1446	59.579
2041	0.274	1407	1.589	\$0.114	\$44	\$0.1478	56.979
2042	0.258	1400	1.625	\$0.114	\$41	\$0.1511	54.493
2043	0.242	1393	1.661	\$0.114	\$38	\$0.1545	52.115
2044	0.228	1386	1.698	\$0.114	\$36	\$0.1580	49.841
					¢2 245		\$2.24E

\$2,245 \$2,245